

From: Dawn Wolfson <dewolfson@aol.com>
Sent: Friday, March 17, 2023 11:49 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board; BOS-District IV; BOS-District II; BOS-District V; BOS-District I; BOS-District III
Subject: Tuesday March 21 Consent agenda item 9. 23-0283 Dissolution of Human Rights Commission

All,

I would like to request that you pull this item from the consent calendar. An item where you are proposing an ordinance which didn't get a unanimous vote on the first reading should not be on consent. It should be a general business agenda item and there should be a full public discussion on it even if the vote is apparently a done deal.

I would also like to address some of the things that were said during the March 14th meeting and some other things.

First, it was stated that the commission had no conservative commissioners. The district two commissioner is an active member of the Republican Party.

It was stated that the board does care about human rights. I don't doubt that you do, but what message does eliminating this commission without first devising an alternative send to the rest of the state, country and world?

One person complained that there was opposition to her appointment because she's conservative. Let me correct the record. There was opposition because she doesn't play well with others. The fact is that the person who ended up getting the appointment is conservative. So much for that.

Another person complained that her complaint wasn't heard by the commission. Where in the ordinance or in the bylaws does it state that the commission is about hearing personal grievances? Wasn't that removed from the ordinance in 2020? "To inquire into incidents of tension and conflict among or between people..."

The commission is too political? How? What examples do you have, and how have you tried to correct that?

The commission is out of control? How can a commission with two county supervisors on it be out of control?

The Oak Ridge incident butted into school district business and tried to direct? I was there. This meeting was held to talk about an incident of great concern to the county and to find out what actions the school and the district were taking. It was educational as per the commission's guidelines.

The board says the commission stepped out of bounds on multiple occasions. What action did the board actually take to correct this? The board has the discretion to remove commissioners and appoint new ones. Surely if the commission was doing the wrong thing and had been given direction and still did not change, the board could have done this. Why wasn't this done?

This is the board's responsibility. Seriously? I've heard complaints made to the board during open forum from Melody Lane, Mandi Rodriguez, Joseph Connelly, Eric Nelson and others, but I have never heard the board address any of them (yes, I know, Brown act). How exactly is the board going to take on human rights issues then? You can't just allow them to talk on open forum. There has to be a mechanism. You don't have a concrete plan. You are eliminating this commission, and then talking about looking around at what you might do. Are you committed to making those things happen (other than adding a paragraph to the board handbook we don't even know what those things are) once this commission has been eliminated?

The homeless forum that the commission put together last year was very well done. Only the two supervisors who were on the commission were there. The forum put a human face on homelessness, and I believe actually got help right afterwards for a homeless veteran who had been injured on the job, and who hadn't been treated right by the worker's compensation system. It raised awareness that likely helped you make our new Navigation Center happen.

There are so many things this commission could take on in addition to civil rights abuses. The residents of Grizzly Flats were not treated fairly by the Federal Government. They need help. The commission could have taken this on.

There is domestic abuse in our county, (by both men and women, incidentally). They could have shone a light on this issue that affects families and children.

The could have taken on human trafficking, false accusations and convictions, food insecurity, the shortage of well-paying jobs and affordable housing, insurance being unaffordable due to the high fire danger, flooding issues, unavailability of affordable broadband in our rural areas, power outages especially affecting the elderly, lack of services for people with disabilities, addiction, etc. etc. etc., and now all of that is on hold until who knows when.

I don't accuse any of you of not caring (you didn't get into public service because you don't care), but I am very, very disappointed.

Sincerely,

Dawn Wolfson
Cameron Park
530 350-8220

From: Larry Brilliant <brilliant@brilliant.org>
Sent: Saturday, March 18, 2023 3:46 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: PETITION
Attachments: Image (10).jpg

You don't often get email from brilliant@brilliant.org. [Learn why this is important](#)

Thank you for your consideration

THE EL DORADOO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IS SEEKING TO DISBAND
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION. I BELIEVE THE HUMAN RIGHTS
COMMISSION HAS VALUE AND MERIT, AND SHOULD BE KEPT AS A VIABLE
COMMISSION IN THE COUNTY. I SUPPORT THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION!

2023

NAME	DATE
1. Douglas Brilliant	3/18/23
2. _____	_____
3. _____	_____
4. _____	_____
5. _____	_____
6. _____	_____
7. _____	_____
8. _____	_____
9. _____	_____
10. _____	_____
11. _____	_____
12. _____	_____
13. _____	_____
14. _____	_____
15. _____	_____
16. _____	_____
17. _____	_____
18. _____	_____
19. _____	_____
20. _____	_____

From: Susan Chandler <susankesslerchandler@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 1:39 PM
To: BOS-District I; BOS-District II; BOS-District III; BOS-District IV; BOS-District V; BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: For your consideration HRC and Implicit Bias Training
Attachments: letter to BOS re HRC.docx

Some people who received this message don't often get email from susankesslerchandler@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Attached please find my comments related to the HRC and Implicit Bias Training. I will try to be on the call on March 21st to read the letter but if I am unable to participate in the call I would like my letter to be put on record.

Susan Chandler
South Lake Tahoe
530-318-3000

March 19, 2023

To: El Dorado County Board of Supervisors
Re: Human Rights Commission and Implicit Bias Training

On your website you list your mission:

Our Mission: El Dorado County government shall provide efficient, courteous and effective services and infrastructure for the safety, protection, and well-being of our residents, businesses and visitors.

If this is indeed your mission, how can you even consider eliminating the Human Rights Commission and implicit bias training?

This County needs a Human Rights Commission and implicit bias training. Incidents of bigotry, hate and unequal access to resources are part of what residents experience every day. Human rights are not limited to discrimination and social interactions. Human rights also include freedom from domestic violence, along with access to clean water, clean air, public health and shelter. These are all County issues we face right now.

Both items (Item# 23-0283 and 23-0479) are on the consent calendar for March 21, which means they will be voted on as part of many other items, without a public hearing. I ask that those items be pulled from the consent calendar and that they be allowed a public hearing. I would also like each supervisor to go on record with their vote on this issue.

Sincerely,
Susan Chandler
530-318-3000
1850 Venice Drive
South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150
susankesslerchandler@gmail.com

From: Sheryl Trainor <sheryl.ghcot@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 8:06 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Agenda Item 9: HRC

You don't often get email from sheryl.ghcot@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Dear El Dorado County Supervisors,

I wrote a letter last week as a county resident who has worked in a non-profit in our community. Today I write as a woman of faith. From words spoken in the past it appears that faith is also a motivating value of members of the Board.

I begin with a quote by Martin Luther King, Jr.:

The ultimate tragedy is not the oppression and cruelty by the bad people but the silence over that by the good people.

In my church we call this a sin of "omission". This week we read the story of Jesus healing the blind man. I invite you to see with eyes and heart wide open. Until we have a program in place to revise or replace the current Human Rights Commission, I believe our county is being blind and deaf to the needs of our community. Bias and racism exist and without government power and funding to implement changes; work of volunteers will be less effective.

For example, I have spent the last three years as a volunteer facilitating small groups discussing the broader history of our country through the lens of faith. The focus expands our understanding of history to include all cultures within the United States and moves participants towards building a community that respects all of its citizens. The existence of a government agency, such as the Human Rights Commission, supports the ideals of this vision and benefits of this work.

I view disbanding the current Human Rights Commission without an existing viable alternative as a sin of omission.

I invite you to consider your vote in light of this view.

Respectfully,

Sheryl Trainor

District 3

From: robin center <robinmcenter@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 8:25 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Human Rights Commission

You don't often get email from robinmcenter@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

To Whom it May Concern.

Once again I'm moved to write a letter to my BOS representative to ask that the Human Rights Commission not be dissolved.

If there are internal issues within the commission or with its interface with the Board, I ask that other remedies to this problem be thoroughly explored.

I don't think it's compassionate or responsible to neglect the people who most benefit from having this commission by disbanding a place they can go to to seek remedy or voice their opinion.

Please consider modifying your vote!

Robin Center

From: dan.trainor@comcast.net
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 9:41 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Agenda Item 9:HRC
Attachments: Dear Members of the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors.docx

You don't often get email from dan.trainor@comcast.net. [Learn why this is important](#)

Please see attached letter to the Board of Supervisors for the upcoming meeting, March 21, 2023.

Thank you,
Dan Trainor

March 19, 2023

Dear Members of the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors,

We need a Human Rights Commission.

I understand members of the board who served on the commission expressed concerns regarding the efficiency of the current commission and concerns over actions commission members made stretching the parameters of their duties. If indeed the case, rather than disbanding the commission we need to strengthen the skills of the members serving, educate members of their duties, or replace the members of the commission. These actions would serve the people of El Dorado County far better rather than dissolving the commission altogether.

If meetings are less efficient, if members' actions created extra work for supervisors, the county needs to provide a clear job description for the members serving on the commission defining their scope of duties and the process of procedures for action.

To disband the human rights commission during this time of civil dissonance would encourage negative behavior and attitudes toward community members who are seen as different. Further, the elimination of a Human Rights Commission instills fear and suppression of those in our community whose voices are minimized by the loud and self-serving. A county supporting a Human Rights Commission is a county encouraging voices to be raised in an appropriate venue guided with procedure and an expectation for all involved to listen with respect to all invested.

If the Board of Supervisors decides the members of the commission are beyond educational training or the members demonstrate an inability to open-mindedly receive needed support the county wishes to provide them, intervention may be unrealistic. However, to disband the Human Rights Commission without first establishing an alternative agency, eliminates the ears of an agency needed to hear the abuses, perceived and real, of the concerned. Before dismantling the commission, an alternative must be in place.

If the current Human Rights Commission is in need of its members to receive training and support, provide training and support; if the membership suffers from dysfunction or inability to work together, replace the members; if the commission need be replaced with an alternative agency, establish the agency first before termination of the current commission, but do not abandon our citizens of their need for a Human Rights Commission or advocacy in El Dorado County.

Thank you for your thoughtful discernment,
Dan Trainor, El Dorado County

From: Debra Sabino <revdebra.oursaviour@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 9:46 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Letter re: Human Rights Commission
Attachments: BOS . HRC.pdf

You don't often get email from revdebra.oursaviour@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)



The Rev Debra+ Sabino
Rector, Church of Our Saviour
Placerville, CA 95667

March 19, 2023

Clerk of the board: edc.cob@edcgov.us

Dear El Dorado County Board of Supervisors,

I recently learned that the Board of Supervisors are considering disbanding the county's Human Rights Commission. I would like to speak in support of keeping the Human Rights Commission. As stated, "The purpose of the Human Rights Commission is to promote tolerance and mutual respect among all persons, and to foster peaceful relations in the interest of preserving the public peace among residents of different races, religions, national origins, and the other characteristics listed in Government Code section 11135."

I believe that such a commission has an important role in the community; it can provide a place for residents to voice concerns, provide education that raises awareness about human rights issues and serve as a bridge between city government and the community.

It is my hope you will vote to keep the commission and in doing so, creating a stronger, more effective body.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter,

Rev Debra Sabino

The Reverend Debra Sabino
revdebra.oursaviour@gmail.com

From: Kate Wells <drwhazzup@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 10:00 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Human Rights Commission

You don't often get email from drwhazzup@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

To whom it may concern,

The decision to disband the Human Rights Commission is wrong and should be reversed.

Many in this county don't have the luxury of knowing they are safe from bigotry, hate speech, and violence. The mission of the commission is to "promote tolerance and respect among different races, ethnic groups, genders, and religions." How could anyone vote against that? What message does it send to disband this commission? I already hesitate to recommend coming to El Dorado County for any of my friends who are in marginalized groups. I've lived here for 30 years and have seen and heard too many twisted comments.

Our county needs help in becoming a place where all are welcome. I would like to assert my support for our county having an active Human Rights Commission.

Sincerely,

Kate Wells

From: terry allen <tga8891@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 6:18 AM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Human Rights Commission

You don't often get email from tga8891@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

I am writing again to voice my support in favor of NOT disbanding the HRC. As a 40+ year resident of EDC, why would the board want to send the message that human rights and the health and safety of our county's residents and visitors are not a priority? Are the supervisors in their districts listening to their constituents on this issue? Thank you for your consideration.

Terry Allen

From: Joseph Connolly <retqmcs@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 8:53 AM
To: BOS-District I; BOS-District II; BOS-District III; BOS-District IV; BOS-District V
Cc: BOS-Clerk of the Board; David A Livingston; Tiffany Schmid; Joseph Carruesco; hhsa-civil-rights@edcgov.us
Subject: Item 23-0128 Comment for March 21, 2023 BOS Meeting
Attachments: DRAFT Board Complaint_HRC_3.19.2023.pdf

Dear Supervisors: I was unable to attend your meeting last week, wherein the majority continued its efforts to disband the Human Rights Commission without any evidence to do so. In watching the video of the meeting it was appalling to see Supervisor Turnboo propose that a civil rights coordinator position responsible for ensuring social services recipients receive benefits without discrimination would be a suitable replacement for a human relations commission for all residents of El Dorado County.

That proposal, and discussion of it, demonstrates clearly and consistently that the majority has no understanding or awareness of Government Code sections 50260-50265, and how to support the Human Rights Commission to fulfill its legal responsibilities and obligations. It also demonstrates how profoundly separate the Board is from its governing principles, that such a proposal could be made without any advance notice or evidence on the record to support it. The Board's failure to abide by its own governing principles, and the Board's senior advisors failure to responsibly intervene or correct blatantly misleading proposals, is a loud and clear signal that the majority cannot responsibly govern, nor that the current Board Chair has any interest in doing so with respect to the Human Rights Commission.

The majority decisions in this matter have been wholly unsupported by any evidence, irrational, and self-serving - all at the expense of the Board's integrity and the County's goodwill.

I am unable to attend tomorrow's meeting on this matter, but am completing a second formal complaint of the majority's rushed effort to disband an important right that all El Dorado County citizens have--the right to an effective and capable Human Rights Commission to carry out a "principal governmental concern and responsibility" in place since 1961. (Govt. Code, section 50261.) My draft complaint is attached for your consideration of the matter on March 21st.

Sincerely, Joseph Connolly

March 19, 2023

From: Joseph Connolly, M.A.

To: El Dorado County Board of Supervisors

Copy: El Dorado County Chief Administrative Officer
El Dorado County Counsel

Subj: Second Complaint Re: Board Decision to Disband the Human Rights
Commission

Ref: (a) My Board Complaint dated March 3, 2023

Dear Supervisors:

Attached is my additional formal complaint to the Board's unfounded decision to disband the El Dorado County Human Rights Commission. ("Commission".)

My formal complaint of March 3, 2023 described the factual and legal basis for contesting the Board's majority decision to disband the commission without any evidence to do so, in disregard of the Board's governing principles, and without adhering to the County Code restrictions on reconsideration of past Board decisions to establish the commission.

This complaint memorializes my objections to the majority's continuation of those same irrational acts to further its own objectives, at the expense of California's commitment to human relations commissions for the benefit of all people.

Sincerely,

s/Joseph Connolly

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents 1

I. Board Discussion – March 14, 2023 1

 A. Supervisor Hidahl’s Support For The Commission 1

 B. Supervisor Laine’s Support For The Commission 2

 C. Supervisor Turnboo’s Unfounded Arguments Against
 The Commission..... 2

 1. Misleading Comparison To Civil Rights Coordinators For
 Social Services’ Recipients 2

 2. “This Commission Has Gotten Way Too Political” 4

II. Board Discussion Following Public Comment 5

 A. Supervisor Hidahl’s Focus On Law Enforcement And The
 “Shasta County” Proposal 5

 1. A Vacuum of Relevant Information 6

VI. CONCLUSION 8

 A.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

B.

I.
BOARD DISCUSSION - MARCH 14, 2023

Supervisor Wendy Thomas, Board Chair, opened the item by describing it as “pretty self-explanatory,” and asked if there were “any Board comments at this point?”¹

Supervisor Thomas did not acknowledge the originating matter of January 3, 2023, Board item 22-2067, which was to discuss and fill Board appointments “to various Boards, Commissions or Committees for 2023.”

Nor did Supervisor Thomas acknowledge that the returned Board item 23-0128 of January 24, 2023 was *not* what the Board directed to be returned when it voted to return item 22-2067 for further discussion of an unfilled Supervisor vacancy to the Human Rights Commission (“Commission”).²

A.
SUPERVISOR HIDAHL’S SUPPORT FOR THE COMMISSION

Supervisor Hidahl remarked, “I feel deep in my heart there’s a need to continue something in the area of human rights. ... It doesn’t appear [Bridging Divides El Dorado] is a viable potential. ... I would be pleased to entertain a discussion of alternative paths if we do think there is something here.”

“I do think the [commission] serves a very valuable purpose. If we were to be inclined to restructure it, reformat it, I think we could make sure that the expectations of the Board were met, but at this point in time, I would hope we find a way to continue something in this area because I think it’s absolutely necessary in our communities. There’s been a long history of things that we need to be able to understand why people feel the way they do, and hopefully over time, be able to influence and change that.”

“I think [the commission] has a valid purpose. I’d like to see it continue and how that happens is to be determined.”

¹ See Board discussion and public comment during video time 1:23:28 to , at https://eldorado.granicus.com/player/clip/1822?view_id=2&redirect=true&h=b141cb420eecf4fef96cc17c7b93367b.

² See March 3, 2023 Complaint (“First Complaint”), pp. 6-9.

B.
SUPERVISOR LAINE'S SUPPORT FOR THE COMMISSION

Supervisor Laine reaffirmed her commitment to fulfilling the Board's *mandatory* appointment of two Supervisors to the commission.³

"...I did volunteer to serve on this commission at our last meeting in which a discussion around the Human Rights Commission took place and I still stand by that position."

C.
SUPERVISOR TURNBOO'S UNFOUNDED ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE COMMISSION

Supervisor Turnboo repeated the majority's reliance on making unfounded statements, without any factual evidence to support them, as a basis for disbanding the commission.

He started with an informal fallacy argument, akin to a "straw man," or "hollow man" view; e.g., "...you gotta understand there's only nine counties that adopted this-Human Rights Commission through the state of California."⁴

1.
**MISLEADING COMPARISON TO CIVIL RIGHTS COORDINATORS
FOR SOCIAL SERVICES RECIPIENTS**

Supervisor Turnboo then explained that he looked at different alternatives, "and Shasta County ... has a civil rights coordinator up there. They don't have a Human Rights Commission; they have a coordinator."

Without entering any evidence into the item record, Supervisor Turnboo proceeded to read information about Shasta County's "coordinator" in an attempt to mislead the public about the responsibilities and obligations of the commission under Government Code, sections 50260-50265.

Supervisor Turnboo failed to mention that the California Department of Social Services has a "Civil Rights Unit" to "ensure[] effective access and nondiscrimination

³ See First Complaint, p. 23, citing El Dorado County Ordinance Code ("EDC Code"), section 2.20.1102(B)(1).

⁴ See brief discussion of straw man fallacy and contemporary examples at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Straw_man.

to all applicants and/or recipients of benefits and services provided by the Department and county welfare departments. Activities include discrimination complaint investigations, county compliance monitoring, technical assistance, training, and ongoing monitoring for state and federal regulatory compliance.”⁵

Supervisor Turnboo also failed to mention that the El Dorado County’s Health and Human Services’ civil rights coordinator for *HHSA benefits and services* is listed online, along with all other County civil rights coordinators. (See Figure 1.)⁶

<p>El Dorado County Amanda Scarr (she/her/hers) El Dorado County Health and Human Services Agency 3057 Briw Road, Suite B Placerville, CA 95667 Phone: (530) 295-6902 Fax: (510) 217-2385 E-mail: hhsa-civil-rights@edcgov.us</p>

Figure 1
El Dorado County HHSA Civil Rights Coordinator

Without *any apparent knowledge* of what a County Civil Rights Coordinator is, or does, Supervisor Turnboo promoted his example *from Shasta County* as a substitute for an authorized Human Relations Commission under Government Code, sections 50260-50265, saying, “And I think this is the better way to go.”

⁵ See description of Department of Social Services Civil Rights Unit at <https://www.cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/civil-rights>. See Department pamphlet “PUB-13,” titled “Your Rights Under California Public Benefits Programs” at <https://www.cdss.ca.gov/Portals/9/Additional-Resources/Forms-and-Brochures/2020/M-P/PUB13.pdf>.

⁶ See list of County civil rights coordinators at <https://www.cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/civil-rights/county-coordinators>.

2.

“THIS COMMISSION HAS GOTTEN WAY TOO POLITICAL”

After describing his family history of having “half-breed” Indian lineage, and his view of its negative effect on that personal history, Supervisor Turnboo segued to say, “I think this particular human rights commission has gotten way too political. I think there’s a problem there. And I think it should have been addressed a long time ago, and it wasn’t.”

“And I think the best way to solve this, I think we need to look at different alternatives to resolve this problem, *and I think Shasta’s doing the right thing with the civil rights coordinator.*” (bold, italics font added.)

Supervisor Turnboo did not describe any details of his complaints, nor place any evidence into the record to support them. Nor did he describe any “different alternatives” in any detail or with any evidence, other than his passing reference to an irrelevant comparison from Shasta County.

The local Mountain Democrat newspaper repeated Supervisor Turnboo’s “Shasta” idea without any clarification that a social services civil rights coordinator is not a County wide human rights commission vested with mandatory legal responsibilities and obligations under Government Code sections 50260-50265.

“District 2 Supervisor George Turnboo referenced Shasta County’s Health and Human Services Agency civil rights coordinator and its procedures of reporting alleged discrimination as an alternative method of supporting human rights in the county.

“I think this particular human rights commission has gotten way too political,” Turnboo said. “I think there is a problem there ... it should have been addressed a long time ago and it wasn’t. I think the best way to solve this is to look at different alternatives and I think Shasta has done the right thing with the civil rights coordinator.” ”⁷

Neither Supervisors Parlin or Thomas made any additional comments before opening the matter to public comment.

⁷ See “Vote goes 3-2 to dissolve Human Rights Commission,” at <https://www.mtdemocrat.com/news/human-rights-commision/>.

II.
POST PUBLIC COMMENT BOARD DISCUSSION

Following extensive public comment, Supervisor Thomas invited other Supervisors to make any additional comments.

A.
**SUPERVISOR HIDAHL'S FOCUS ON LAW ENFORCEMENT
AND THE "SHASTA COUNTY" PROPOSAL**

Supervisor Hidahl began with saying, "So, after listening to public comment I'm even more concerned with the cancellation of this human rights commission. *Something* needs to continue." (bold, italic font added.)

Instead of acknowledging the law governing a California human relations commission, and the financial and staffing resources available to fully support a commission under that law, Supervisor Hidahl latched on to Supervisor Turnboo's "Shasta County" proposal as a potentially viable solution, before expanding his comments to include his view of the necessity for the El Dorado County Sheriff's Department and District Attorney's involvement in human rights matters.⁸

"I do like the idea that Supervisor Turnboo brought forward that there is other solutions here. And it was brought up that maybe it's a combination of things, and so what I would like to see is a continuation that would allow us to have a better dialogue with the Human Rights commissioners and the approaches that Supervisor Turnboo has talked about, because when I hear what he's read off is that role, my first question is how does that interact with the Sheriff's Department? Because our law enforcement is a key part of how we deal with the illegal activities related to human rights, as is our District Attorney, etc."

"I'd like to understand it better, how Shasta County works that. If the person is not a member of the Sheriff's Department, how do they get the information they need to be able to make judgments, decisions, recommendations, whatever it is that's going on?"

⁸ Government Code, section 50263 reads, "The governing body may assign personnel to the commission or permit the commission to employ an executive director, a secretary, and such attorneys, experts and other employees as may be necessary, within the amount made available by the local governing body and to accept and expend funds from private, as well as public, sources. Each city and county is hereby authorized and empowered to make such appropriation for such expenses and for the compensation, if any, to be paid to the members of the commission." (bold font added.)

“Because I think that would considerably help the ‘educate’ part if we had somebody gathering that information and looking at what are the key issues we have at this point in time? How do we direct our education towards that process? So I do see the opportunity for kind of a dual role here at some point, but I want to look into it a little more.”

“It’s just not enough time to understand it, *hearing it just today*, but again, our law enforcement has to be a key aspect of what we look at relative to human rights and violations and claims and I just don’t know how that integrates right now. I don’t have a good sense of all the things that are being reported that are being properly addressed.” (bold, italics font added.)

“And I think that’s what this role is in Shasta County, it sounds like, but how do they get that information, because our Human Rights Commission has asked for information from the Sheriff’s Department and the District Attorney as I understand it, and it’s never been available because that is confidential information....”

1.

A VACUUM OF RELEVANT INFORMATION

Supervisor Turnboo’s proposal to substitute a limited civil rights enforcement role for recipients of social services benefits, in lieu of a human relations commission with mandatory responsibilities and obligations, shows a profound ignorance of the applicable law and its application, and a profound failure of the Board’s system “to making decisions based on quality information, evidence and data.”⁹

For example, a human relations commission’s mandatory responsibilities and obligations do not specify taking law enforcement or legal action to enforce violations of human rights. (See Gov’t Code, §§ 50264-50265.)

However, the commission is **mandatorily obligated to** “issue any publications and reports of investigation as in its judgment will tend to effectuate the purposes of this article”, “encourage and stimulate agencies under the jurisdiction of the local governing body that created the commission to take any action as will fulfill the purposes of this article”, and “ [t]o submit an annual report to the governing body.” (*Id.*, §§ 50265, subs. (b), (d)-(e).)

⁹ See e.g., First Complaint, p. 21, citing the Board’s Governance Handbook section on “Preparation.”

From: Melinda Velasco <velamar333@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 10:42 AM
To: BOS-District II; BOS-District III; BOS-District IV; BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Item 23-0283 Human Rights Commission

Dear Supervisors Parlin, Thomas and Turnboo,

It appears that letters sent to you by your constituents are not a priority for you. None of you responded to the timeline I sent you last week detailing all of the good work the Human Rights Commission has done over the last four years. Since "the human rights commission hasn't done anything" was one of the key arguments posed by Lori Parlin, I thought the timeline would be helpful. It appears your minds are made up. Therefore I won't waste my efforts trying to communicate with you here.

In Brief:

- Please Move Item 23-0283 from the Consent Calendar. **Transparency is part of good governance.**
- Vote to Keep the Human Rights Commission

-Melinda Velasco

From: erterlich <erterlich@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 10:47 AM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board; BOS-District II
Subject: Petition in support of retaining the Human Rights Commission
Attachments: IMG_20230320_0002.pdf

Some people who received this message don't often get email from erterlich@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Please reconsider your decision to disband the HRC at the 3/21/23 BOS meeting.

Robert Erlich
South Lake Tahoe

From: cgbraver@comcast.net
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 11:05 AM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: 230283

Dear Supervisors,

A vote to disband the human rights commission as presently constituted is not a vote against human or civil rights, but a correction of a commission that has mistaken its mission in the service of ideology. Disbanding it in its present form is the right decision.

Carole Braverman

EDH

From: Gina Abrams <gina.abrams4@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 12:24 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Keep the Human Rights Commission

You don't often get email from gina.abrams4@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Dear Clerk of the Board,

I write with deep concern that the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors has voted 3-2 to disband the Human Rights Commission and that you will be voting on the final passage to dissolve it at your March 21 Board Meeting (Item 23-0238).

I add my voice to the overwhelming public support to *keep* the Human Rights Commission and let it serve its important function of protecting those who are unfairly treated, discriminated against, intimidated, bullied, victimized, or any other form of infringing upon a person's innate rights. The fact that these awful incidents have already occurred here is proof that such a commission is needed.

I want our county to clearly demonstrate that it values human rights for everyone and will do all it can to safeguard all who reside here. Keeping a commission where concerning incidents can be heard and earnestly addressed does that. Disbanding it, however, sends a loud message that El Dorado County does not care about such things. Do you see the implied permission that sends to those inclined to commit human rights violations and the inevitable increase in hateful incidents to which it will will lead?

You have a chance to reconsider this poor decision and show that El Dorado County Board of Supervisors is a compassionate body dedicated to creating more respectful, peaceful communities throughout our beautiful county. I ask that you do so on March 21st but voting against dissolving the Human Rights Commission.

Thank you,
Gina Abrams
El Dorado Hills

From: Della Clavere <dellaclavere@comcast.net>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 12:30 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Human Rights Commission

[You don't often get email from dellaclavere@comcast.net. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

Dear Supervisors,

Please remove the Human Rights Commission agenda item from the consent calendar and place it in Open Forum.

I was disappointed to see 3 out of 5 supervisors vote to disband the Human Rights Commission. I see this vote as the epitome of the old saying about "throwing the baby out with the bathwater". Please reconsider and work with the existing commission and our community at large to improve upon it.

Until this uproar and reading the articles in the Sacramento Bee, I did not even know our county had a Human Rights Commission. When I found out it existed, I felt hopeful. Now that more of us know about it, perhaps we can all work together to better understand the issues and help strengthen and move human rights forward in our county's communities. At least take John Hidahl's suggestion to give it more time for consideration.

Thank you for any consideration you can give, Della Clavere

From: Gina Abrams <gina.abrams4@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 12:38 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Keep the Human Rights Commission (corrected)

You don't often get email from gina.abrams4@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Dear Clerk of the Board,

I write with deep concern that the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors has voted 3-2 to disband the Human Rights Commission and that you will be voting on the final passage to dissolve it at your March 21 Board Meeting (Item 23-0238).

I add my voice to the overwhelming public support to *keep* the Human Rights Commission and let it serve its important function of protecting those who are unfairly treated, discriminated against, intimidated, bullied, victimized, or any other form of infringing upon a person's innate rights. The fact that these awful incidents have already occurred here is proof that such a commission is needed.

I want our county to clearly demonstrate that it values human rights for everyone and will do all it can to safeguard all who reside here. Keeping a commission where concerning incidents can be heard and earnestly addressed does that. Disbanding it, however, sends a loud message that El Dorado County does not care about such things. Do you see the implied permission that sends to those inclined to commit human rights violations and the inevitable increase in hateful incidents to which it will lead?

You have a chance to reconsider this poor decision and show that El Dorado County Board of Supervisors is a compassionate body dedicated to creating more respectful, peaceful communities throughout our beautiful county. I ask that you do so on March 21st by voting against dissolving the Human Rights Commission.

Thank you,
Gina Abrams
El Dorado Hills

From: tita bladen <tita-b@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 12:59 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board; BOS-District I
Subject: BOS meeting 3/21/23 Agenda Item 23-0283

Public Comment for Agenda Item 23-0283 BOS Meeting March 21, 2023

Dear El Dorado County Board of Supervisors,

I support the Human Rights Commission as a vital resource for El Dorado County. Thank you to Supervisor Hidahl and Supervisor Laine for trying to give the HRC, BOS, and the community time to come up with an agreeable solution instead of disbanding the HRC.

Please take this item off the consent calendar and move it to each BOS stating their vote. It would be appropriate for the BOS to acknowledge the work and efforts of the HRC Commissioners.

We need the HRC to be able to Educate, Communicate, and provide the connection to resources that can help marginalized communities. El Dorado County can be a culturally rich environment if we continue to support these resources.

Thank you,
Dorotea Bladen
El Dorado Hills, BOS District 1
Resident and Homeowner since 1990

Sent from my iPad

From: Eric Magneson <em2magneson@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:02 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Once more, I'm expressing my support for the continued existence of the Human Rights Commission

You don't often get email from em2magneson@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Dear El Dorado County Board of Supervisors,

Once again, I would like to voice my support for the continued existence of our county's Human Rights Commission. Disbanding the Human Rights Commission, especially without allowing for dialogue between the commissioners and the Board, broadcasts a very public message that human rights and the health and well-being of our county's citizens and visitors are not a priority for this Board.

In her March 13th comments, Supervisor Thomas asked her audience *not* to assume that the board doesn't care about human rights. While I want with all my heart to believe that what she says is true, the actions of the Board speak otherwise.

During the Board meeting, Supervisor Thomas read from the March 7, 2017 Civility Resolution that the Board passed and adopted. The resolution concluded with:

be it further resolved that the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors will **actively engage and pursue mechanisms to improve understanding, dialogue, and tolerance within our county and communities.**

Supervisor Thomas underscored that the Civility Resolution was an **active** resolution. If this were true, the Board would, in fact, choose to preserve the Human Rights Commission as the commission's by-laws declare it to be a *mechanism to improve understanding, dialogue, and tolerance within our county and communities*. Moreover, the Board has refused to **actively engage** in dialogue with the Human Rights Commission about its decision to terminate the group. The Board's refusal to dialogue with commissioners is beyond disrespectful; not only is it unfair but it also violates the due process right established by the Fourteenth Amendment. Ironically, the Board's active resistance to engaging in dialogue with the Human Rights Commission highlights the very need for the commission in the first place. This refusal to allow the commissioners the opportunity to redress the accusations leveled against them goes against the Civility Resolution that Supervisor Thomas so earnestly purports to believe in. If the Board cannot even uphold the basic procedural right of due process, then how can community members truly expect the Board to uphold their human rights without a Human Rights Commission in place?

Supervisor Hidahl pointed out last Tuesday that BOS advisory groups are the Board's arms and legs. They are the grassroots letting the Board know what's going on in their constituent communities. As Hidahl stated, the Board can't be everywhere, nor can they hear everything on their own. They rely upon grassroots community organizations and networks to provide recommendations "on what [the Board] can do to change the environment we are in." The HRC's purpose is to listen to community members who've been on the receiving end of hateful and unjust acts, to educate communities about human rights, and to keep the Board abreast of abuses and discrimination occurring within their communities. The commission is meant to be a welcoming, safe sounding board for vulnerable people and groups to express

their piece. Without a Human Rights Commission in place to hear these folks out, where can they go, realistically, with their concerns? People whose human rights have been violated often don't have the freedom to appear on their own in front of the Board of Supervisors, nor do they necessarily have the desire to do so as it could set them up for further targeting. The Human Rights Commission is a vital and necessary clearinghouse for vulnerable populations in our county. As such, it should continue on with its good work.

I will end this letter by asking the Board of Supervisors to please walk their talk and postpone their final vote for two months, enabling supervisors to engage in open, productive dialogue with the Human Rights Commissioners, whereby all parties can address expectations, missteps, and successes of the commission. Such a conversation would, at the very least, allow the commissioners to exercise their right to due process.

Thank you for your time.

Respectfully yours,

Moira Magneson
Placerville

From: dpvanderkar@comcast.net
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:12 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Do not eliminate the Human Rights Commission. Item on March 21 BOS agenda

Dear Madam Chair and Supervisors,
Please do not eliminate the Human Rights Commission.
There are too many instances occurring in this county that should come to the forefront of the Commission's attention, even if they are not now.

If you believe that the HRC is ineffective and too expensive for the current results, that seems to me to be cause for reworking the directions given and the policy running the HRC, not tossing it out entirely. There is much to be considered in the county regarding the topic of human rights.

I had a granddaughter who was so thoroughly bullied at Oak Ridge HS that it caused severe mental health problems.

Children and teens need help with how to manage interactions with those not like them.
Adults could use education about managing with respect the differences in our county.

Please find a way to make use of this commission and its focus, and not just eliminate it.

Sincerely,
Peg Vanderkar
Placerville CA

From: Les Francis <les@sierraforward.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:15 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board; BOS-District III; BOS-District I; BOS-District II;
boshour@edcgov.us; BOS-District V
Cc: Les Francis
Subject: Opposition to abolition of the Human Rights Commission
Attachments: Memorandum to the EDC Board of Supervisors 3 20 23.docx

You don't often get email from les@sierraforward.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

I urge the board to read and consider these comments before tomorrow's (Tuesday's) session.

Thank you.

Les Francis

Camino

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows

March 20, 2023

To: Members of the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors

From: Les Francis,

Re: Abolition of the county's Human Rights Commission

I am writing today to urge that the Board reconsider its apparent determination to abolish the Human Rights Commission. It should be noted that I am writing both as a resident/voter in the county, but also as a leader of Sierra Forward (www.SierraForward.com).

I have stated our position publicly before. And I stated it privately in a meeting with Supervisor Thomas last Friday. It is clear from the Board's reaction generally, and Ms. Thomas's response specifically, that I might as well been whistling into one of the atmospheric river winds we have ben enduring of late.

My arguments have had no effect whatsoever. More telling is the fact that the scores of people who have weighed in on behalf of saving the commission—versus very few on the opposing side—have add the same effect, zilch.

But we are making one last try.

My first boss, essential mentor and close friend in the political realm was the late Norman Y. Mineta (Mayor of San Jose, Member of Congress, and Cabinet Secretary to two Presidents—one a Democrat and one a Republican).

As a ten-year-old boy in 1942, Norm and his family were expelled from their home in San Jose at gunpoint and sent to a "relocation camp" in Wyoming. They were among the 120,000 Americans of Japanese ancestry so treated. Their constitutional rights were abridged wholesale and completely. This shameful episode will forever tarnish the history of our great country (as will other historic

sins—slavery, Jim Crow, the extermination of millions of Native Americans, vigilantism aimed at migrants among them)

Norm would constantly remind those privileged to work for him that he, his family and other Japanese Americans were treated the way they were because of two things: 1) How they looked; and, 2) there was no one in an official capacity, and no agency, to which they could turn for help or advocacy.

That's a good reminder, it seems to me, as the Board pursues its ill-considered action vis-à-vis the Human Rights Commission. Think what happened to Norm Mineta couldn't happen again? Think again. Pay attention what's happening in our county right now.

Perhaps you will benefit from reading the quote from Reverend Martin Niemoller, who said about Nazi Germany (where he lived, preached, and was eventually imprisoned),

"First, they came for the socialists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a socialist.

"Then they came for the trade unionists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a trade unionist.

"Then they came for the Jews, and I did not speak out—because I was not a Jew.

"Then they came for me—and there was no one left to speak for me."

From: Patricia Kriz <patkriz@earthlink.net>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:18 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Item 23-0283 on BOS Agenda for Tuesday, March 21, 2023

You don't often get email from patkriz@earthlink.net. [Learn why this is important](#)
edc.cob@edcgov.us

Attention: Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

To: The Supervisors of El Dorado County
Wendy Thomas, Chair, District 3
John Hidahl, District 1
George Turnboo, District 2
Lori Parlin, District 4
Brooke Laine, District 5

Re: Item 23-0283 on the BOS Agenda for Tuesday, March 21, 2023
The Dissolution of the Human Rights Commission for El Dorado County

Dear Supervisors:

I have written to Supervisor John Hidahl previously regarding my support for the existing Human Rights Commission in El Dorado County. I want to reiterate my support at this time.

Your impending action to dissolve and abandon the Human Rights Commission on your Consent Agenda this Tuesday, March 21, is unwise. The timing is so bad, and the optics are terrible. You have received numerous pieces of correspondence by email and post, as well as public statements in your meetings, in support of the Human Rights Commission, but you have not provided a Public Forum for discussion of this action item with opportunity for full give and take discussion.

Your action to disband and discard the Human Rights Commission has been covered by The Sacramento Bee, The Tahoe Daily Tribune, and the Mountain Democrat newspapers, leaving the impression that El Dorado County at the highest governance level does not care about human rights. The individual supervisors have stated otherwise, but actions speak louder than words! Your proposed action to dissolve and abandon the Commission is like a bold headline for the community of supporters saying: **"WE DON'T CARE WHAT YOU THINK"**.

You as a Board do not have the time or the inclination to listen to the many people who have complaints about human rights problems in this county, because you have so many other governance obligations, or so some of you have stated. Individuals who want to voice their concerns do not want to bring their many small grievances to the supervisors because they fear that their complaints will seem petty. However, problems pile up, and these individuals could benefit by using the Human Rights Commission and individual commissioners to air their grievances and resolve some of them. The Human Rights Commission is a great sounding board that allows problems to be aired and dealt with at a lower level of intervention than the Sheriff's Department,

the Mental Health Department, the Social Services Department, or the judicial system. The Commissioners role as educators is valuable. The cost has been negligible.

I have already told my supervisor of incidents in El Dorado Hills that warranted the attention of the Human Rights Commission. I recently heard that an activity group in a nearby community is chaired by a man who told members the reason he moved to El Dorado County is because it is "so white"! This kind of thinking is problematic on so many levels. I am embarrassed for my friends and neighbors who have to deal with people like that, and I do my best to exhibit the opposite kind of behavior. I appreciate the problems that the Human Rights Commission is dealing with because they are real, they are important, and they are personal.

I used to live in Peoria, Illinois, many years ago. It was common knowledge that a black man or woman should not venture or remain at night across the river in Pekin, Illinois, for any reason as it was too dangerous. That is the reputation that Placerville and parts of El Dorado County are getting, and that is so unfortunate. We need to work on issues like this, and the Human Rights Commission is an appropriate forum for these kinds of discussions.

Please pull Item 23-0283 from the Consent Agenda and table it for future discussion at an appropriate forum. It will be to your credit and greatly appreciated by those who support the Human Rights Commission.

Sincerely,

Patricia Kriz
3388 Patterson Way, El Dorado Hills, CA 95762
916-933-0850 home
916-802-1388 cell
patkriz@earthlink.net

From: Susan Chandler <susankesslerchandler@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:21 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: 2 signatures in support of the HRC

You don't often get email from susankesslerchandler@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

THE EL DORADOO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IS SEEKING TO DISBAN
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION. I BELIEVE THE HUMAN RIGHTS
COMMISSION HAS VALUE AND MERIT, AND SHOULD BE KEPT AS A VIABLE
COMMISSION IN THE COUNTY. I SUPPORT THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION!

2023

NAME

DATE

1. Susan K Chandler (Susan Chandler) 1850 Venice March 19, 2023
SLT, CA

2. Russ Dahler Russ DAHLER 1944 Venice Mar 19, 2023
So. Lake Tahoe

3. _____

4. _____

5. _____

6. _____

7. _____

8. _____

9. _____

10. _____

From: Angela Chance <angelarenaychance@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:25 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Input on 23-0283
Attachments: input item 23-0283.pdf

You don't often get email from angelarenaychance@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Please see attached letter with my input for the upcoming vote on NOT disbanding the Human Rights Commission.
Thanks.

To: El Dorado County Board of Supervisors

Re: Item 23-0283

March 20, 2023

I'm writing to you to show my support for **NOT** disbanding the County Human Rights Commission.

As a person in the LGBTQ+ community I have often seen and heard of times when there has been hateful speech directed at us in El Dorado County. I think it's important to have a group such as the Human Rights Commission to continue to exist to help educate our local population on issues that they may not otherwise really hear about.

We're all just people trying to live our lives and co-exist with each other. We need help doing that sometimes and the Human Rights Commission could/should be a local source for our entire El Dorado County population to hear about and learn with.

Thanks,

Angela Chance

From: Kathleen Mintert <kathleenmintert@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:07 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: BOS March 21, 2023 Consent Calendar Item 23-0283

Dear El Dorado County Supervisors,

I write again in support of the Human Rights Commission. Please remove Item 23-0283 from the March 21, 2023 consent calendar and allow discussion of the Commission on your meeting agenda.

Why are you ignoring the overwhelming support for this Commission by your constituents?

--Kathleen Mintert
Placerville

From: Christine Ann <christineann157@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:20 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Item 23-0283M - HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

You don't often get email from christineann157@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

To the Board of Supervisors,

I am writing today as a lifelong member of El Dorado County. I grew up in Shingle Springs and even went to school at the 'College behind Raley's, so many years ago. I also raised 2 beautiful daughters in the area. I urge you to please keep the Human Rights Commission in our County. I personally have witnessed discrimination and racism within El Dorado county on numerous occasions in the more recent years. I have witnessed even MORE in the last 6 years than I have all my years growing up in El Doardo county. More emboldened, more loudly and clearly people voice their opinion to others they believe do not 'belong' here.

- Just recently I saw a White lady tell a Mexican lady at Target to get to the back of the line so the 'American's can go first'. No one said anything. Not even the cashier. I walked over to her (Mexican lady) and grabbed her stuff and took them into my line so she could get out of the hostile area.

It's not about me 'teaching anyone a lesson'. I said nothing to the rude lady at Target. It's about showing people how to act by demonstrating kindness and humanness. I didn't need to know Spanish. I just needed to show support. That is all we need to do. Support those that feel like they don't belong. That FEEL like they do not have a voice. **And just say, 'Hey, I see you. You are not alone'.**

WE can make a stand and help those that are having these hateful acts upon them feel like they do belong. That there are good people who do care. Don't we want to make everyone feel welcome? Or only the ones who look like us? We are a diverse community. And it will become even more diverse in the coming years.

I hope we can continue to have meaningful discussions on how we can continue with the Human Rights Commission.

DIVERSITY is a fact.

EQUITY is a choice.

INCLUSION is an action

BELONGING IS AN OUTCOME

**Thank You,
Christine**

From: Lorraine King <lorraine.king@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:22 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Agenda item 23-0283

RE: Agenda item 23-0283 HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION DISBANDING

Dear Supervisors:

I appreciate all the efforts and the votes of Supervisors Hidahl and Laine in favor of keeping the Human Rights Commission in El Dorado County. It is needed in our county to provide a platform for our vulnerable and marginalized friends and neighbors to speak. Having that official channel helps our county to be a welcoming and safe community for all people. Disbanding the HRC will have a negative impact; I have no doubt.

On the 21st, I urge the Board to pull this item off the Consent Calendar. Allow more discussion of this action and allow transparency of the Board's votes.

Thank you for giving all of us a chance to be heard.

Sincerely,

Lorraine King
23 year resident of El Dorado Hills

From: emailcmm@gmail.com
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:39 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: HRC - Item 23-0283

[You don't often get email from emailcmm@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

To the EDC BOS,

I would like to submit to the BOS my opposition to disband the Human Rights Commission.

In our current political climate of intolerance, discrimination and racism the HRC is more important than ever. It gives vulnerable and marginalized groups a safe place to heard. The HRC serves our community by collecting data on HR violations. They have developed relationships with other community organizations which allows for open communication and education about diversity and inclusion.

It is important to me that we live in a community that supports an HRC and wants to protect and support all of its residents and visitors.

I ask you to reconsider disbanding the EDC Human Rights Commission.

Sincerely,
Courtney Jackson
Placerville Resident

From: Jill Blue Keith <jill@jillbluekeith.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:44 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Cc: Jill Keith
Subject: Refer to Item 23-0283 --- You have to ask yourself.... Who, what, why this change even exists
Attachments: Memorandum to the EDC Board of Supervisors 3 20 23.docx

You don't often get email from jill@jillbluekeith.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

I agree with the below statement from Les Francis. Please re-read the message below, then ask yourself...

- Who wants this change
- What will happen with this change
- Why do they want this change

If the Board wants to be more involved, go to the meetings, work with the existing commission.

- Do you really have time to address this problem in El Dorado County?
- Do you think this is not a problem in El Dorado County?

March 20, 2023

To: Members of the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors

From: Les Francis,

Re: Abolition of the county's Human Rights Commission

I am writing today to urge that the Board reconsider its apparent determination to abolish the Human Rights Commission. It should be noted that I am writing both as a resident/voter in the county, but also as a leader of Sierra Forward (www.SierraForward.com).

I have stated our position publicly before. And I stated it privately in a meeting with Supervisor Thomas last Friday. It is clear from the Board's reaction generally, and Ms. Thomas's response specifically, that I might as well been whistling into one of the atmospheric river winds we have ben enduring of late.

My arguments have had no effect whatsoever. More telling is the fact that the scores of people who have weighed in on behalf of saving the commission—versus very few on the opposing side—have add the same effect, zilch.

But we are making one last try.

My first boss, essential mentor and close friend in the political realm was the late Norman Y. Mineta (Mayor of San Jose, Member of Congress, and Cabinet Secretary to two Presidents—one a Democrat and one a Republican).

As a ten-year-old boy in 1942, Norm and his family were expelled from their home in San Jose at gunpoint and sent to a "relocation camp" in Wyoming. They were among the 120,000 Americans of Japanese ancestry so treated. Their constitutional rights were abridged wholesale and completely. This shameful episode will forever tarnish the history of our great country (as will other historic sins—

slavery, Jim Crow, the extermination of millions of Native Americans, vigilantism aimed at migrants among them)

Norm would constantly remind those privileged to work for him that he, his family and other Japanese Americans were treated the way they were because of two things: 1) How they looked; and, 2) there was no one in an official capacity, and no agency, to which they could turn for help or advocacy.

That's a good reminder, it seems to me, as the Board pursues its ill-considered action vis-à-vis the Human Rights Commission. Think what happened to Norm Mineta couldn't happen again? Think again. Pay attention to what's happening in our county right now.

Perhaps you will benefit from reading the quote from Reverend Martin Niemoller, who said about Nazi Germany (where he lived, preached, and was eventually imprisoned),

"First, they came for the socialists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a socialist.

"Then they came for the trade unionists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a trade unionist.

"Then they came for the Jews, and I did not speak out—because I was not a Jew.

"Then they came for me—and there was no one left to speak for me."

Begin forwarded message:

March 20, 2023

To: Members of the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors

From: Les Francis,

Re: Abolition of the county's Human Rights Commission

I am writing today to urge that the Board reconsider its apparent determination to abolish the Human Rights Commission. It should be noted that I am writing both as a resident/voter in the county, but also as a leader of Sierra Forward (www.SierraForward.com).

I have stated our position publicly before. And I stated it privately in a meeting with Supervisor Thomas last Friday. It is clear from the Board's reaction generally, and Ms. Thomas's response specifically, that I might as well been whistling into one of the atmospheric river winds we have ben enduring of late.

My arguments have had no effect whatsoever. More telling is the fact that the scores of people who have weighed in on behalf of saving the commission—versus very few on the opposing side—have add the same effect, zilch.

But we are making one last try.

My first boss, essential mentor and close friend in the political realm was the late Norman Y. Mineta (Mayor of San Jose, Member of Congress, and Cabinet Secretary to two Presidents—one a Democrat and one a Republican).

As a ten-year-old boy in 1942, Norm and his family were expelled from their home in San Jose at gunpoint and sent to a "relocation camp" in Wyoming. They were among the 120,000 Americans of Japanese ancestry so treated. Their constitutional rights were abridged wholesale and completely. This shameful episode will forever tarnish the history of our great country (as will other historic

sins—slavery, Jim Crow, the extermination of millions of Native Americans, vigilantism aimed at migrants among them)

Norm would constantly remind those privileged to work for him that he, his family and other Japanese Americans were treated the way they were because of two things: 1) How they looked; and, 2) there was no one in an official capacity, and no agency, to which they could turn for help or advocacy.

That's a good reminder, it seems to me, as the Board pursues its ill-considered action vis-à-vis the Human Rights Commission. Think what happened to Norm Mineta couldn't happen again? Think again. Pay attention to what's happening in our county right now.

Perhaps you will benefit from reading the quote from Reverend Martin Niemoller, who said about Nazi Germany (where he lived, preached, and was eventually imprisoned),

"First, they came for the socialists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a socialist.

"Then they came for the trade unionists, and I did not speak out—because I was not a trade unionist.

"Then they came for the Jews, and I did not speak out—because I was not a Jew.

"Then they came for me—and there was no one left to speak for me."

From: Gale Hesselgesser <galerespect@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 2:57 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Tearing Apart the Human Rights Commission

Attn:

El Dorado Board of Supervisors

Re. Intention to dismantle the Human Rights Commission

Some thoughts that arose as I watched you vote down the Human Rights Commission last Tuesday:

“They’ve already made up their minds.”

“They don’t really want to actually do anything about human rights violations.”

“They just want us to think they care about human rights because they wrote a resolution in 2017- but they won’t actually

enable anything to happen to address the bullying and discrimination as it occurs...a resolution with no action plan is

an empty gesture.”

“They don’t want to know what’s going on so they can pretend that it doesn’t exist.”

“Their ‘explanations’ are empty...I can only imagine what their real reasons are.”

“This doesn’t look good”

(The Board voted down offering Implicit Bias Training- in this time of division and threatening reactions against certain

groups of people)

(El Dorado is the only county in the state of California that proudly permits a replica of a lynched body hanging from a

noose in the main business district of its County Seat. Is that what we're proud of?...Looks like it!)

In profound disappointment,

Gale Hesselgesser

From: Sandra Gonzalez <slgon146@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 3:13 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Consent Calendar Item 23-0283/Human Rights Commission
Attachments: HRC.docx

Good afternoon!

Please distribute the attached letter to all El Dorado County Board of Supervisors prior to meeting on March 21, 2023.

Thank you.

Sandra Gonzalez, Resident
El Dorado Hills

"Stand confident in your truth. Trust and listen to your soul's song."

From: Robin Valicenti <robinvalic3nti@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 3:42 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Dissolving the Human Rights Commission

Please distribute to the all Supervisors in regard to item 23-0283 Human Rights Commission

Dear Board of Supervisors,

I am highly troubled by your vote last week to dissolve the Human Rights Commission despite the overwhelming public support not to do so. There was very little support to dissolve the commission as seen in the vast amount of recorded letters and public testimony during the BOS meeting of 3/14/2023.

In addition, the last HRC report given to the BOS was on 11/8/22 and can be seen below

https://eldorado.granicus.com/player/clip/1740?view_id=2&redirect=true&h=e8e3713cd4ac465bc5106e14c7db9737

at time marker 52:30

During this meeting commissioners Simpkin and Carr gave the BOS a report of commission activity. Ms Carr gave a report on the El Dorado County Homeless Forum and her report was met with praise from all the BOS members. It must be noted that Supervisor Turnboo specifically stated that he really appreciated what Ms. Carr is doing for the district and county and the homeless population and how well she is representing him and his district as a human rights commissioner. There was no mention by anyone that the BOS was planning or considering to dissolve the commission in the near future. There was a concern raised by Ms Parlin regarding the speaker series potential speakers however she quickly deferred to the sitting supervisors on the commission. The next communication the HRC had with the BOS was when the HRC was notified of its dissolution.

I am a commissioner and never once had any opportunity to appear before the BOS aside from offering public comment as a private citizen and that was 3 minutes with no discourse. The HRC was bushwhacked and paralyzed before any procedural and statutory vote took place to dissolve the HRC. The HRC was slandered with unfounded accusations lacking in merit during the BOS meetings that followed. My only opportunity to face my accusers was in the public comment space during the BOS meetings and I was not afforded any statutory or regulatory opportunities to protect and safeguard myself against the slander, defamation and misrepresentation thrust upon me. I have acted in good faith and good will commensurate with my education and long career as a mental health practitioner and community worker who is expected and governed by law to do no harm and maintain health equity among all peoples who suffer discrimination and marginalization.

I have asked over and over for a list of specific accusations or charges against me. I have never received such. I believe I have a civil right to face my accusers, in removal of my post, whose accusations cause professional harm and violate their very own governance structure.

It has been noted by **Supervisor Laine as a new member of the BOS, that she has noticed the BOS exhibit a pattern of abolishing and eliminating commissioners, commissions or advisors that they do not agree with. This includes eliminating the requirement for Implicit Bias Training after two or three commissioners (out of 150 commissioners or so) left their posts in part due to the required Implicit Bias Training. I agree with Supervisor Laine and I am the newest member of the HRC.**

In the motion to dissolve the HRC, **Supervisors Thomas, Laine and Parlin** are the responsible supervisors doing such without having had any discussion, conversation or discourse with the commissioners regarding

9. 23-0283 Clerk of the Board, based on direction provided the Board of Supervisors, recommending the Board Approve the Final Passage (Second Reading) of Ordinance 5175 amending Title 2, Article XIV, Section 2.20.110 (et.seq.), dissolving the El Dorado County Human Rights Commission. (Cont. 3/14/2023, Item 17) .

The HRC commissioners never took political action and in fact never made any recommendations or suggestions for an ordinance or statute/ governance modification to the BOS at all. To date, the BOS has never stated what specific actions the HRC was being accused of.

The BOS has acted in negligence pertaining to governance and altered county ordinance code along with county infrastructure to harm the safety, protection, and well-being of our residents, businesses and visitors who lose the social protections of required Implicit Bias Training and access to the El Dorado County Human Rights Commission whose mission is to foster peaceful relations in the interest of preserving the public peace **among residents of different races, religions, national origins, and the other characteristics listed in Government Code section 11135.**

Where do you expect our residents of different races, religions, national origins, and the other characteristics to seek county support in a safe space dedicated to the protection of human rights?

This action is very irresponsible and bigoted Ms Thomas, Ms Parlin and Mr Turnboo.

Please do not dissolve this commission.

You have heard the voices of victims of racism, poverty, homelessness, marginalization, drug addiction, domestic violence and you choose to remove them from the conversation or participating in civic discourse by shutting down their portal to belonging.

You are now refusing victims such as LGBT or domestic Caldor fire refugees in EDC without clean water to have a commission to represent them and listen to them. This is all recorded in your BOS minutes, archived video of the homeless forum, and in the many letters sent to you.

Please reverse your decision to dissolve the human rights commission and respect the marginalized people you serve.

I also lost faith in your leadership through this attempted action. I do see Ms Parlin as the ringleader in abolishing the HRC and implicit bias training. In my opinion she is a dangerous leader.

I have witnessed Ms Parlin walk out of a meeting in which she did not get the appointment to an ad hoc economic development committee that she believed she and Ms Thomas were entitled to.

Not a good look for a supervisor to mimic a petulant child during an official meeting.

It can be seen here during the 3/7/2023 BOS meeting here:

https://eldorado.granicus.com/player/clip/1818?view_id=2&redirect=true&h=9037d306437b5e5f2f09e23400610b08

The conversation begins at minute marker 4:29, Ms Parlin becomes defensive at minute marker 4:48 and she walks out in need of a break here 4:50/4:51 after she loses the vote.

This strikes me as some type of unhealthy power and loss of control behavior. Not good.

-Robin Valicenti

From: Mary Elliott-Klemm <ml.elliott@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 3:42 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Item 23-0283. Abolishing the Human Rights Commission

Dear Board of Supervisors:

"Human rights are moral principles or norms for certain standards of human behaviour and are regularly protected in municipal and international law." wikipedia

People who feel that their rights have been abused deserve a government that will provide an avenue for protection.

All over the world countries who value Human Rights have established governmental institutions to protect the Human Rights of their citizens. This is common practice for those governmental entities who value those rights.

This is not a new idea, it has been around for many years: The Human Rights Council, which was established in 2006, meets in Geneva. It replaced the 60-year-old UN Commission on Human Rights as the key independent UN intergovernmental body responsible for human rights.

It is very simple, if you value the Human Rights of the citizens of El Dorado County you will figure out a way to have a meaningful and effective Human Rights Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Elliott-Klemm
Somerset, CA 95684

From: Roger W Klemm <synthesisdesigngroup@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 3:53 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Human Rights Commission

I am writing to the Board to request that the Consent Calendar Item 23-0283 be pulled from the Consent Calendar and be placed on the regular agenda so that additional discussion and a record of each Supervisor's vote will become public record. I am opposed to the abolition of the Human Rights Commission in El Dorado County. Shame on you.

Roger Klemm
Somerset, CA

From: Sandra Gonzalez <slgon146@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 20, 2023 3:13 PM
To: BOS-Clerk of the Board
Subject: Consent Calendar Item 23-0283/Human Rights Commission
Attachments: HRC.docx

Good afternoon!

Please distribute the attached letter to all El Dorado County Board of Supervisors prior to meeting on March 21, 2023.

Thank you.

Sandra Gonzalez, Resident

El Dorado Hills

"Stand confident in your truth. Trust and listen to your soul's song."

March 20, 2023

RE: Consent Calendar Item 23-0283

KEEP THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION!

To the Honorable El Dorado County Board of Supervisors:

Here I am again with another letter, for the record, asking you, pleading with you, to reconsider eliminating the Human Rights Commission.

At your last meeting Supervisor Hidahl requested extending the conversation to allow time to meet with the Commission, to initiate discussion perhaps to restructure or reformat the Commission, to make sure it met the expectations of the Board.

But his request was denied.

Why? What harm is there in discussing options with the Commission members?

What are you afraid of? The truth? This county has a huge negative discrimination problem.

Everyone knows it. Unfortunately, too many have experienced it and been hurt by it.

You are not fooling anyone by comments such as: it's the Board's "responsibility... to promote mutual respect, tolerance, and goodwill..."

If that were true you would be actively supporting the continuation of the Human Rights Commission and making its success and awareness in the community one of your highest priorities.

Instead, you are hiding this item under the Consent Calendar to prevent the public from seeing your individual votes and having them put on record.

How cowardly! It follows your despicable cowardice in failing to recognize the vast needs of the marginalized people in all our communities to feel safe, seen, and understood by the County.

Give the Human Rights Commission an opportunity to defend their work.

Start a sincere and productive conversation to improve this Commission, not eliminate it.

Respectfully,

Sandra Gonzalez, resident
El Dorado Hills
95762