

**COUNTY OF EL DORADO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
PLANNING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**



Agenda of: October 23, 2014

Staff: Aaron Mount

REZONE/SPECIAL USE PERMIT/PARCEL MAP

FILE NUMBERS: Z04-0015/S01-0011/P08-0036/Springs Equestrian Center

APPLICANT: Dennis Graham

AGENT: TSD Engineering/Casey Feickert

REQUEST: The project consists of the following requests:

1. Tentative Parcel Map to create two parcels, 45.77 acres (Parcel 1) and 100.65 acres (Parcel 2) in size;
2. Rezone from Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5)/Estate Residential (RE-10) to Recreational Facilities (RF) for Parcel 1 only; and
3. Special Use Permit for an equestrian facility with two covered arenas 45,000 square feet each, stall barns for 420 horses, five fenced riding areas, 12,000 square-foot equestrian retail store/office/clubhouse, camping for horse trailers during events, special events with up to 250 spectators, and an eight foot tall by nine foot wide monument sign with 48 square feet of display area.

LOCATION: South side of Green Valley Road, at the intersection with Deer Valley Road, in the Rescue area, Supervisorial District 1. (Exhibit A)

APN: 115-410-05 (Exhibit B)

ACREAGE: 146.42 acres

GENERAL PLAN: Low Density Residential (LDR) (Exhibit C)

ZONING: Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5) & Estate Residential (RE-10) (Exhibit D)

ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT: Mitigated Negative Declaration (Exhibit AA)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Planning Commission recommend that the Board of Supervisors take the following actions:

1. Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration based on the Initial Study prepared by staff;
2. Adopt the mitigation monitoring program in accordance with CEQA Guidelines, Section 15074(d), as incorporated in the Conditions of Approval and mitigation measures;
3. Approve Z04-0015 to rezone proposed Parcel 1 from Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5)/Estate Residential (RE-10) to Recreational Facilities (RF) based on the Findings;
4. Conditionally approve tentative Parcel Map application P08-0036, based on the Findings and subject to the Conditions of Approval; and
5. Conditionally approve Special Use Permit application S01-0011, based on the Findings and subject to the Conditions of Approval.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Staff has reviewed the project for compliance with the County's regulations and requirements. An analysis of the proposal and issues for Planning Commission consideration are provided in the following sections:

Background

The project was continued off calendar at the July 26, 2012 Planning Commission (Commission) hearing in order for the applicant to provide the Commission additional information on the following issues: asbestos, wetlands, noise, emergency access and egress, vehicle traffic used to remove horse waste removal, water usage and quality, campground noise, traffic impacts, generators and lights, grading on-site, filling of ponds, special events, and hours of operation.

Site Description

The 146 acre project site lies at an elevation of approximately 1,100 feet above mean sea level and is comprised of gently rolling terrain. Vegetation communities present on-site include Valley oak woodland, valley/foothill riparian, annual grassland, wet meadow, and mixed chaparral. The site is currently used as a cattle ranch. Adjacent land uses include single-family rural residences, a middle

school, undeveloped lands and paved roadways. Proposed project access would involve the improvement of the existing driveway into the site from Deer Valley Road to Standard Plan 103D requiring a minimum width of 24 feet. An encroachment onto Green Valley Road will be required for exit use only. Existing improvements include two single family residences and various agricultural structures.

Adjacent Land Uses

	Zoning	General Plan	Land Use/Improvements
Site	RE-5 & RE-10	LDR	Residential/ Single-Family Residences & Undeveloped
North	RE-5/RE-10	RR/LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences & Undeveloped
South	RE-5	LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences
East	RE-5	PF/LDR	Public Facilities & Residential/School Site & Residential
West	RE-5	LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences

Discussion: The project vicinity is primarily residentially-zoned land with larger lot sizes (five acres and larger). The project parcel is bounded on the west and south by residential land uses, to the east by a middle school, and to the north by agricultural and residential uses. The project is an area of rural, low density residential, and educational uses. The project parcel is within the Cameron Park Community Region (See Exhibit C).

Project Description

The project includes a Rezone, Tentative Parcel Map, and Special Use Permit proposed as follows:

Rezone: The rezone would change the current split zoned parcel from RE-5 and RE-10 to Recreational Facilities (RF) for proposed Parcel 1 only. Parcel 2 of the site would remain RE-5 with no development proposed at this time.

Tentative Parcel Map: The Tentative Parcel Map would create two parcels comprising 45.77 acres (Parcel 1) and 100.65 acres (Parcel 2) from the 146.42-acre parcel.

Special Use Permit: The Special Use Permit would allow construction of an equestrian center on Parcel 1 with the following features:

- a. Boarding/grooming stalls for 420 horses.
- b. Two covered arenas 45,000 square feet each.
- c. One 45,000 square-foot fenced arena.
- d. One 37,500 square foot fenced arena.
- e. One 31,250 square foot fenced arena.

- f. Three 80-stall barns; one 40-stall barn; seven 20-stall barns. Horses are kept in 12 x 12 foot box stall barns or in 12 x 24 foot pipe stall barns with a total of 280 box stalls and 140 pipe stalls. Barn stalls will be painted aluminum with a composite panel interior. Concrete pier footing will be provided on all construction. Architectural metal roofing will be coated in hunter green paint and the barn siding will be coated in beige color paint.
- g. One 13,000 square foot dressage arena.
- h. One 111,000 square foot grassed arena.
- i. One 12,000 square-foot clubhouse consisting of an equestrian retail store/office/clubhouse/fitness center. First floor: Retail store and fitness center approximately 3,000 square feet each; Second Floor: Office/conference rooms comprising approximately 6,000 square feet.
- j. One eight foot tall by nine foot wide unlit-monument sign with approximately 48 square feet of display area.
- k. Camping spaces for trailers and recreational vehicles (RV) equipped with electrical and water hook-up outlets. These facilities would be an extension of the horse shows and are not intended to be a full time public campground. Maximum occupancy would be 90 people and maximum length of stay would be ten days to coincide with the length of horse shows. Forty trailer and RV spaces are identified. No generators will be allowed, and no sewer connection will be provided.
- l. The main entrance will encroach off Deer Valley Road and be gated. The internal circulation will extend from the main entrance to the east side of the property where a second vehicle exit will be provided onto Green Valley Road. This exit will serve as an emergency, RV and trailer, horse show, and event exit.
- m. Interior circulation is typically closed to car and truck traffic, except for equipment loading and unloading. Some interior driveways will be provided for car access to the barns. Speed limit is 5 MPH.
- n. A total of 165 developed parking spaces and overflow parking for approximately 86 vehicles.
- o. An existing 3,600 square-foot single family home-to be used as a management residence and office, 1,058 square-foot second residence-to be used as a residence for employees, 5,000 square-foot storage building, hay storage service area, and three other minor accessory structures are currently located on the subject property and will remain as part of this project.
- p. The equestrian center will be fenced with ranch fencing around its entire exterior perimeter. White rail PVC fencing will outline many working areas within the equestrian center. Horse arenas will be made from three-rail white PVC fencing.
- q. Interior lighting within the covered arenas will be directed downward. Uncovered arenas will not contain lighting.
- r. Annexation into the El Dorado Irrigation District is proposed to connect the site to public water.
- s. Septic systems currently on the property will provide for waste water disposal at the main house and second residence. A new septic system will be installed for the clubhouse and horse wash stalls.
- t. A monument sign or plaque may be placed identifying special species of plants and non-sensitive artifacts throughout the property.

The following uses:

1. The proposed equestrian facility will include approximately 32 staff members, as follows:
Management: The facility management team will oversee all accounting, boarding agreements, horse shows, and general operations. The facility management will oversee all care and maintenance of the facility and will reside at the facility to provide a 24-hour presence, seven days per week. The management team will include clerical staff, retail store staff, show staff, safety and ground inspection staff. A point of contact will be provided and published. A 24-hour phone answering service will be provided with a live person contact, for immediate or emergency communication. An email address will be provided for written contact and communication.
Staff: One stall hand for every 40 stalls boarded to provide the twice daily stall mucking and removal and general cleaning. One person per 100 horses for feeding two times per day. Two grounds personnel for general maintenance and security. Additional facility personnel will be employed as conditions warrant. The number of administration and staff employees will vary as conditions warrant. Seasonal staff will be employed for horse shows, weddings, and special events.
2. Hours of operation for the equestrian center are 7:00 AM to 9:30 PM seven days a week.
3. The retail store will be for members only and shall not be available to the public without membership. The members and boarders will have immediate access to purchase equine care products, feed, vitamins, supplements, grooming products, tack, apparel, and riding equipment. Hours of operation will be within the equestrian center hours.
4. The fitness facility to provide for physical strengthening will be for members only and not available to the public without a membership. The facility will not contain a salon, spa, nor a shower area. Hours of operation will be within the equestrian center hours and will be closed during horse shows.
5. Offices will provide space for administration, accounting, and management. Office hours are 6 am to 6 pm Monday through Friday and closed on weekends.
6. Seminars will be conducted and located in the conference rooms of the clubhouse office area and will provide for continuing education, conferences, and meetings. The conference rooms may be made available to local clubs and community organizations for meetings and events in support of special needs. The size of each class will not exceed 30 people and be generally held in the evenings from 6 pm to 9 pm.
7. Horse Shows:
Twelve to 18 regular shows per year, plus two annual shows per year.
Regular shows run two days, typically Saturday and Sunday 8 am to 6 pm.
Annual shows run four to eight days (Two shows maximum per year), typically Saturday through the following Sunday from 8 am to 6 pm.
Horse Shows will consist of English, Equitation/Pleasure, Dressage, and others. Sound announcement will be conducted as soft non-horse alarming and simple commands for Equitation/Pleasure Classes such as “turn your horses”, pause then, “jog your horses”, etc. All other Shows do not require sound announcement during their performances.
The required workers would be up to four show judges and administrative staff of four to six people.

Attendees will include primarily those with boarded horses.

Horse shows will be narrated by microphone and speaker system within the covered and open arenas.

8. Weddings:

To be held Friday 5 pm to 9:30 pm, Saturday 10 am to 9:30 pm, and Sunday 10 am to 9 pm, so that guests will have left the premises by 10 pm.

Weddings shall be prohibited during horse shows and events.

Maximum: Two weddings per day, four per week, and a maximum 150 people per wedding.

Wedding ceremonies will be conducted on the grass in front of the existing main house and in the covered arena. The reception will be held at the main residence and/or deck, or in the covered arena.

Amplified music and speech will be provided.

Weddings will be seasonal as they will normally be held outdoors.

9. Special events:

Events to be held during facility hours will end no later than 9:30 pm, so that attendees will have left the facility by 10 pm.

A maximum of six special events per year.

Events will not be held during weddings or horse shows.

10. Maximum occupancy of the site will be 300 people at any one time.

11. Open or uncovered arenas are groomed daily to keep the footing (sand base footing) workable for the rider and eliminate dust within the arena. Proper grooming consists of watering the arena area in the morning (6 am to 8 am). During summer months, arena will be watered an additional time at mid-day.

12. Feed delivery is two to three times per month to the existing hay storage barn.

13. Trash clean-up is a minimum of twice per day. A commercial carrier will pick up the trash containers as scheduled, or at a minimum of once per week.

14. Horse stalls are cleaned twice per day, seven days per week. The manure and soiled bedding is gathered together along with any waste and placed into a 45 yard commercial bin. The bin is covered and keeps the manure in a sealed environment. Common areas are cleaned daily of any droppings and placed into the manure containers.

15. All box stall barns will be equipped with an automatic fly control system from which a fly control solution is automatically sprayed. Barns will also have large agricultural air movement fans.

16. An air system is installed in each barn to retain and discard odors.

17. Equipment used daily at the equestrian center will consist of simple farm and ranch implements.

18. All speakers will be designed and placed to direct all sounds away from the neighboring residential uses and will utilize less power in the speaker output. The facility staff shall measure and monitor all noise levels during the horse shows, weddings, and events to ensure compliance with noise standards under General Plan Policy 6.5.1.7.

Phasing of facility development is as follows:

Equestrian Facility Phases:

- 1st year – Complete required common area improvements.
- 2nd year – Complete two arenas, and boarding for 40 horses.
- 3rd year – Complete one arena, and boarding for 80 new horses.
- 4th year – Complete one arena, and boarding for 120 new horses
- 5th year – Complete one arena, and boarding for 100 new horses.
- 6th year – Complete one arena, and boarding for 80 new horses.

Clubhouse:

Commence in 2nd year, complete in 3rd year.

The project would also include the annexation of the subject site into the El Dorado Irrigation District (EID) for the provision of public water. A water line extension is required from the existing water line in Green Valley Road. Sewage disposal will be by individual septic systems.

Access

Primary site access would be provided off Deer Valley Road, a privately-maintained road. An exit only access will be provided onto Green Valley Road. Proposed off-site road improvements are discussed in the circulation section below. These points of access/egress would allow all users and emergency responders to enter and exit the project site and have been designed to ensure ingress and egress of vehicles pulling horse trailers. In addition, the project's internal roadways would comply with fire safe standards as the Rescue Fire Protection District has reviewed the project and confirmed that the two encroachments and on-site roadways are adequate for the development.

Air Quality

The El Dorado County Air Quality Management District reviewed the submitted air quality analysis and determined that the project would have a less than significant impact on the air quality with the implementation of the mitigation measures identified within the prepared Mitigated Negative Declaration (Exhibit AA).

Building Design

Preliminary elevations for the proposed retail store/clubhouse/office, shown on the northwest corner of the site plan, are attached as Exhibit O. Preliminary elevations for the 60- and 80-stall barns as well as the covered arena are also included in Exhibits Q and S. Typical project colors are attached as Exhibit U for the stalls, barns, and covered arenas. The retail store/office/club house would have wood siding painted light brown with dark brown trim and the roof would consist of dark brown tile. Staff reviewed the proposed building elevations, materials, height, colors and overall appearance and concluded that they would be consistent with the applicable zoning district regulations and community design standards. The Rescue Fire Protection District (RFPD) requires a maximum of 31 feet in height on four sides of the buildings as this is the maximum reach of their equipment. The retail store/office/club house building has been redesigned to meet this requirement and to be consistent with the maximum height limit for the RF zone district. Additionally, all building plans

would be reviewed at the building permit application stage by the RFPD. Building Services reviewed the project and noted that all permits will be processed as commercial building permits.

Cemetery

At the Planning Commission hearing evidence was given by the public that there was a possibility of a cemetery on the project parcel. This evidence was a map contained in a published history of the Rescue area. The cultural resource survey determined there was no current evidence of a cemetery on the site but stated that there is a possibility that evidence of the cemetery may have been removed by past owners. The archaeologist recommended that a defined area (Exhibit Z) be shown on the parcel map that has a high potential for containing the potential cemetery, if it exists, and any grading within the area would be subject to mitigation measure MM CR-3 requiring a cultural resource professional to be on-site at the time of grading within the defined area and be subject to our standard conditions for human remains. The mitigation measure has been agreed upon by the applicant and the El Dorado County Cemetery Administration.

Circulation

The *Traffic Impact Assessment for the Springs Equestrian Center in El Dorado County* was originally prepared in December 2003 by K.D. Anderson and Associates (KDA). This was subsequently revised in September of 2011 to consider changes to the project. In November of 2013, KDA prepared an addendum to the Traffic Study to consider further changes to the project, as well as to evaluate access to the project. In May of 2014, KDA prepared a supplement that addressed weekend traffic, and in August of 2014 another addendum was completed to bring the traffic counts up to current.

The traffic study concluded that the project would be expected to generate 71 AM peak hour trips and 47 PM peak hour trips. The project will increase the daily traffic volume on surrounding roadways, resulting in Level of Service (LOS) C in the AM peak hour and LOS D at the PM peak hour. The May 20, 2014 supplement analyzed special events that would take place on weekends and concluded that service would remain at LOS C. These Levels of Service (LOS C and LOS D) for the forecast conditions fall within the County minimum LOS D standard in Rural Regions and LOS E standard in Community Regions.

Capital Improvement Project #76114, Green Valley Road/Deer Valley Road Turn Lanes, resulting in left turn pockets at this intersection, has been completed. The Transportation Division has also applied conditions of approval to the project requiring the widening of Deer Valley Road from Green Valley Road to the project site to a 24-foot wide paved roadway per Standard Plan 101C and improvement of the exit only encroachment onto Green Valley Road in accordance with Standard Plan 103C.

Drainage/Grading

Drainage/grading issues are addressed within the prepared environment document and were determined to result in a less than significant impact with the implementation of recommendations contained within the project's geotechnical study, drainage study, and compliance with the County Grading Ordinance. According to the preliminary grading plan (Exhibit H) proposed grading for the

equestrian facility would result in the fill of approximately 31,000 cubic yards and the cut of approximately 66,500 cubic yards at the subject site. The applicant intends to leave excess material on the site. Conditions of approval are included that addresses drainage issues identified by the Transportation Division. The project would be consistent with General Plan Policy 7.1.2.1 as no slopes in excess of 30 percent would be disturbed.

Fire

The Rescue Fire Protection District will require new fire hydrants for the site as well as on-site access roads to be improved to a minimum width of 20 feet with no parking permitted within the improved 20 foot width. Additionally, all buildings greater than 3,600 square feet would need to have fire sprinklers installed prior to occupancy. Fire issues are addressed within the project's conditions of approval.

Landscaping

Staff reviewed the preliminary landscape plan, Exhibit V, and determined that it would meet the requirements contained in Section 17.18.090. The overall landscape plan takes into account the proposed recreational use and open space areas. The applicant would need to submit a final landscape plan at time of building permit submittal that would be reviewed by Development Services staff. Additionally, staff would make an on-site inspection to verify compliance with the final landscape plan prior to occupancy.

Land Use Compatibility

As discussed above, the subject site is surrounded by rural residential uses, Pleasant Grove Middle School, and approved subdivisions to the north and east. Several mitigation measures and standard conditions of approval address exterior lighting, dust and fly control, odor, noise, traffic and hours of operation. Compliance with these mitigation measures and conditions of approval would address any potential land use incompatibility issues with adjoining and future land uses. Therefore, the proposed project would be compatible within the context of these surrounding land uses in compliance with General Plan Policy 2.2.5.21.

Lighting

A review of the project's photometric evaluation and lighting plans (Exhibit Y1-7) indicate that the proposed arena lighting and exterior barn lighting would be consistent with the County's Outdoor Lighting Ordinance (Section 17.14.170). All lighting would be required to be fully shielded so as to prevent lighting glare onto adjacent properties. The proposed lighting is clustered in the northwest corner of the 153 acre project parcel making it highly unlikely that the proposed lighting would spill over onto adjacent properties. Final photometric plans would be required at the building permit application stage to ensure compliance with the County's Lighting Ordinance.

Local Agency Formation Commission (LAFCO)

LAFCO review and approval would be required for the proposed annexation into the El Dorado Irrigation District (EID) for public water service for the subject site. Annexation into EID would need to occur prior parcel map recordation to ensure water service is available.

Naturally Occurring Asbestos (NOA)

The project site is identified as having the potential for NOA. A geotechnical analysis was performed which included six test trenches to test for NOA (Attachment 13 of Exhibit AA). The report concluded that all samples were negative and that NOA is not found within the project area to be improved.

Noise

A noise analysis was conducted for the proposed project to review potential impacts from special events and amplified speech and music (*Environmental Noise Assessment Springs Ranch Equestrian Center El Dorado County, California*. Bollard Acoustical Consultants, February 2014). The assessment concluded that noise generated during equestrian events and outdoor receptions, including amplified speech and music and sound generated by unamplified voices, will be compliant with El Dorado County noise standards at the property lines of the nearest existing residences and the school to the southeast.

The noise analysis indicates that amplified music played at the outdoor reception area on the deck of the existing residence would be at or below County noise standards subject to compliance with mitigation measure MM-NOI-1 maintaining the level of amplified speech or music at or below 90 dB Lmax and 75 dB Leq at a 50 foot reference distance from the speakers requiring speakers to be pointed away from adjacent residences, and all reception activities to be completed by 10 pm. The recommended monitoring program will ensure full compliance with County noise standards.

While the data for the covered arena indicate that the County's evening noise level standards were exceeded during the event simulation, it should be noted that the measurement results were defined primarily by traffic on Green Valley Road. In the absence of traffic, observed noise levels due to the event simulation were noted as being less than 50 dB Leq. Given the setback to the nearest residential property lines to the northeast, the shielding of event noise in the direction of those residences by intervening topography, and the masking of event noise in that direction by Green Valley Road traffic, no noise impacts are anticipated at those nearest residences to the northeast. Because the speakers would be pointed away from the nearest residences to the south and west (over 500 feet from the center of the arena area), amplified speech and music noise levels at those locations are predicted to be well below thresholds of the County noise standards.

The project was also analyzed for potential noise impacts from persons engaged in conversation with raised voices and RV and horse trailer parking noise. Both uses would be below the thresholds of the County noise standards, as well.

Oak Tree Canopy

Existing project oak tree canopy coverage is estimated at 19.05 percent or 27.9 acres of the site (*Proposed Oak Tree Mitigation Plan for the Springs Ranch Equestrian Center*, Kurt Stegen, March 7, 2012). As proposed, 5.48 percent or 1.53 acres of the existing oak canopy is to be removed consistent with the Interim Interpretive Guidelines for El Dorado County General Plan Policy 7.4.4.4 allowing the removal of 10 percent of the existing oak canopy. A replanting plan has been submitted that is consistent with Option A of the Interim Interpretive Guidelines for El Dorado County General

Plan Policy 7.4.4.4. The project as proposed is consistent with the oak tree canopy protection and replacement requirements of General Plan Policy 7.4.4.4 and the Oak Guidelines Revised October 07, 2007.

Parking

Parking requirements for the proposed use are not specifically addressed within Section 17.18.060 of the *El Dorado County Zoning Ordinance*. However, the applicant operated the Coto Valley Equestrian Center with 300 boarded horses in Southern California. This existing facility is similar in size to the proposed center in El Dorado County. Based on the parking demands for this similar existing facility plus the additional boarding proposed, 165 total parking spaces are proposed including 40 occupied trailer spaces. Additionally, Exhibit E shows potential overflow parking for approximately 86 vehicles. The greatest impact would be special events with a maximum attendance of 250 persons and at a conservative ratio of one space per two attendees there would be adequate parking. Therefore, the proposed parking areas with a total of 165 developed spaces and 86 overflow spaces would provide sufficient parking for the proposed use.

Schools

The project was routed to the Rescue Union School District for review and comment. However, no comments or concerns were received. There is an approximately 1,200 foot separation between the school and the proposed equestrian facility. The school could be considered a sensitive receptor; however mitigation measures MM-AQ-1 and MM-AQ-2 would remove the possibility of dust or odor being a significant impact to the student population. At the previous Planning Commission hearing the representative from the school district expressed concerns about naturally occurring asbestos. Review of previously submitted geotechnical studies has shown that the site does not have the potential for significant naturally occurring asbestos issues; however the site will still require an Asbestos Dust Mitigation Plan to be submitted to the Air Quality Management District prior to any grading activities.

Signage

As shown in Exhibit I, the applicant has proposed a monument sign at the southeast corner of the intersection of Green Valley Road and Deer Valley Road. The sign would be eight feet tall and nine feet wide with approximately 48 square feet of display area. Proposed sign materials include heavy timber and a rock base. As shown on Exhibit M the sign display areas of Panels A, B, and C are a total of 48 square feet. The applicant has agreed to not add lighting to the sign consistent with the RF zone district (Section 17.48.050.M) that signs are unlit.

Trailer and RV Camping

The project proposes overnight parking for 40 trailers and recreational vehicles to be used during events. Overnight parking of trailers and recreational vehicles would only be available during horse shows and special events and would have electrical hook ups so that no generators need to be used. The noise analysis concluded that this use would be consistent with County noise requirements.

Water Resources

General Plan Policy 7.3.3.4 requires development projects to be set back a minimum of 100 feet from all perennial streams, rivers, lakes, and 50 feet from intermittent streams and wetlands. The project site plan identifies an intermittent stream and wetland features. The applicant has redesigned the project to meet the 50 foot intermittent stream and wetland setback as verified by the submitted wetlands delineation. No direct impacts are proposed to any wetland or riparian features on the project site.

High density sheltering of horses has the potential of adverse effects on water quality through waste runoff entering water bodies. The project has been designed and mitigated to reduce the potential of animal waste entering the stream that runs the length of the property. A grassy swale is shown on the site plan (Exhibit E) that is designed to intercept runoff from the development of the equestrian facility. Water from washing horses will be disposed of by the use of a septic system. Mitigation Measure HWQ-1 requires baseline water testing of the stream for nitrates and coliform and thereafter annual testing to ensure no impacts to water quality from animal waste.

Water/Sewer

Public water service would be provided to the project site by EID, if annexation is approved by LAFCO as discussed above. EID provided a Facilities Improvement Letter dated December 3, 2012 indicating that it has adequate existing water and wastewater capacity and supplies to serve the proposed project. Based on this information, the project would be consistent with General Plan Policies 5.2.1.3 and 5.2.1.4 regarding connection to public water, and availability of reliable water supply.

The Facilities Improvement Letter further states that concerning sewer facilities there is a lift station serving the project area that is located at the southeastern edge of the subject property. Connection to this system would require a full sewage lift station and onsite sewer main to be constructed. The project engineer supplied an opinion of cost for these improvements at a total of \$555,185. In addition to the cost, the connection would potentially impact identified wetlands and listed species. As this is a private recreational facility it can be seen as a transitional land use as the highest possible demand of the project site is not being proposed. At such time as a more intensive use of the project site is proposed, such as residential, public sewer would be required to be included in the project design. Due to the required annexation, opinion of cost, and potential environmental impacts, findings have been made that it is not feasible to connect to public wastewater collection facilities and that the project is consistent with General Plan Policy 5.3.1.7.

A naturally occurring spring may be used for agricultural and landscaping uses. The County has determined that it has no jurisdiction over non-potable uses of a spring that the property owner has water rights to.

Wetlands

No wetlands are proposed to be directly impacted by the project. All development will comply with General Plan requirements for setbacks of 50 feet from intermittent streams and wetlands. A cease and desist order has been issued by the US Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) for wetland

disturbance in the area of the parcel that is not proposed to be developed. The USACE has stated that the project may proceed and it will ensure that any violations are permitted or mitigated.

Utilities

Pacific Gas and Electric Company (PG & E) reviewed the proposed project and had no substantial comments. However, PG & E noted that the existing easement affecting the northwest portion of the subject site would need to be kept free of structures to allow for continued utility vehicle access. The site plan does not contain any structures within the PG & E easement.

GENERAL PLAN

The project has been reviewed in accordance with the applicable El Dorado County 2004 General Plan policies identified below and it has been determined that the project is consistent with the General Plan. While many of these topics have already been addressed in the previous section of the staff report, further discussion of those General Plan issues not already discussed above is provided below.

Land Use

Policies 2.2.1.2, 2.2.5.3 and 2.2.5.21 concerning land use designation, rezoning and land use compatibility have been reviewed as follows:

Policy 2.2.1.2. The subject site has a Low Density Residential (LDR) General Plan land use designation which serves as a transition area from Community Regions and Rural Centers into the agricultural, timber, and more rural areas of the County. As such, the proposed equestrian center is consistent with those uses permitted under the LDR land use designation.

Policy 2.2.5.3. Staff has reviewed the zone change request against the 19 specific criteria under this policy and found that the proposal is consistent with applicable criteria such as availability and capacity of the public treated water system, capacity of the transportation system serving the area and existing land use pattern.

Policy 2.2.5.21. As discussed above, the subject site is surrounded by rural residential uses, Pleasant Grove Middle School site, and an approved subdivision, Silver Springs. Additional development is being considered north of the subject site across Green Valley Road through several project approvals. Several mitigation measures and standard conditions of approval concerning exterior lighting, dust and fly control, odor, noise, traffic and hours of operation are recommended. Staff believes compliance with these mitigation measures and conditions of approval would address any potential land use incompatibility issues with adjoining existing and future land uses. Therefore, the proposed project would be compatible within the context of these surrounding land uses pursuant to General Plan Policy 2.2.5.21.

Rezone: Policy 2.2.5.3 requires that the County shall evaluate future rezoning: (1) To be based on the General Plan's general direction as to minimum parcel size or maximum allowable density; and

(2) To assess whether changes in conditions that would support a higher density or intensity zoning district. The specific criteria to be considered include; but are not limited to, the following:

Criteria	Consistency
1. <i>Availability of an adequate public water source or an approved Capital Improvement Project to increase service for existing land use demands.</i>	Consistent: As discussed above in the Water Supply section in <i>Project Issues</i> , the project would be conditioned to have a safe and reliable water supply on each parcel prior to filing the Parcel Map. The project would require annexation into the EID to obtain the necessary water supply.
2. <i>Availability and capacity of public treated water system</i>	Consistent: As discussed above in the Water Supply section in <i>Project Issues</i> , the project would rely on EID public water for potable water service. The project would require annexation into the EID district before meters can be purchased.
3. <i>Availability and capacity of public waste water treatment system.</i>	Consistent: The project would utilize septic facilities for waste water.
4. <i>Distance to and capacity of the serving elementary and high school.</i>	Consistent: The existing project area is currently served by the rescue Union School District and is directly adjacent to a middle school.
5. <i>Response time from nearest fire station handling structure fires.</i>	Consistent: There are two fire stations within approximately three miles of the proposed facility. The Rescue Fire Protection District (District) would be responsible for serving the project area for structure fires. The District has recommended Conditions of Approval that would require that the project adhere to the applicable building and fire codes, as well as Conditions of Approval regarding the execution of the District Fire Safe regulations. The fulfillment of those recommended conditions would address the fire related safety issues identified by the District.
6. <i>Distance to nearest Community Region or Rural Center.</i>	Consistent: The project site is located within the Cameron Park Community Region.
7. <i>Erosion hazard.</i>	Consistent: The project would require grading for roads and drainage infrastructure to be completed prior to filing of the Parcel Map or initiation of use. This would assure that all existing drainage courses would be adequately protected by the incorporation of appropriate development setbacks and the required strict adherence to Best Management practices during the grading permit process.
8. <i>Septic and leach field capability.</i>	Consistent: The Environmental Health Division has found there would be suitable area on each proposed parcel for adequate sewage disposal.

<p>9. <i>Groundwater capability to support wells.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The project proposes connection to a public water system. Annexation to EID would be required before the connection could be established.</p>
<p>10. <i>Critical flora and fauna habitat areas.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: A Revised Final Biological Resources Study (<i>Spring Ranch Jurisdictional Delineation and Special Status Species Assessment</i>, Michael Brandman Associates, March 8, 2011) was submitted by the applicant that included the results of a survey of the parcel for the special status and locally significant plants and animals and suitable habitat for the same. No special-status species were found on the site.</p>
<p>11. <i>Important timber production areas.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The project site does not contain nor is adjacent to any important timber production areas.</p>
<p>12. <i>Important agricultural areas.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: This property and project is not under and would not conflict with an adjacent Williamson Act Contract and is located within an area which does not contain, nor is it directly adjacent to, lands zoned and designated by the General Plan to be preserved for agricultural use. Agricultural uses are adjacent; however the area is in transition to uses consistent with the Community Region designation.</p>
<p>13. <i>Important mineral resource areas.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The project site does not contain nor is located adjacent to any important mineral resource areas.</p>
<p>14. <i>Capacity of the transportation system serving the area.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The Transportation Division reviewed the submitted traffic study and concluded that the recommended conditions of approval, including improvements to existing roadways, would sufficiently address traffic issues and ensure that the transportation system is adequate to serve the area.</p>
<p>15. <i>Existing land use pattern.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The project site is surrounded by land designated and utilized for low-density and rural residential uses on three sides and is adjacent to a middle school on the other. The proposed parcel map would allow the creation of 45.77 and 100.65-acre parcels which would be consistent with the LDR land use designations as well as the existing land use and parcel size pattern of the surrounding parcels.</p>
<p>16. <i>Proximity to perennial watercourse.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: There were no perennial watercourses identified within the project parcel. Sweetwater Creek, the closest perennial stream, lies approximately one mile north of the project parcel. Intermittent Green Springs Creek runs through the project parcel.</p>
<p>17. <i>Important historical/archeological sites.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: A cultural resources study prepared by Peak & Associates, Inc. July 8, 2005 was completed for the</p>

	<p>subject parcel and reported there were two identified archaeological sites on the project site. Mitigation measures to ensure protection of the sites have been added to the project and are discussed in the Cultural Resource section of the Initial Study. An additional study reviewed the potential for a cemetery and found no evidence. Because of the possibility in the future that ground disturbances could discover significant cultural resources, staff has added standard conditions of approval and mitigation measure for the cemetery to assure that potential issue is addressed during project development.</p>
<p>18. <i>Seismic hazards and present of active faults.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: As shown in the Division of Mines and Geology’s publication, <i>Fault Rupture Hazard Zones in California</i>, there are no Alquist-Priolo Special Studies Zones mapped in El Dorado County. The impacts from fault ruptures, seismically induced ground shaking, seismic ground failure, or liquefaction are considered to be less than significant. Any potential impact caused by locating buildings in the project area would be offset by the compliance with the Uniform Building Code earthquake standards.</p>
<p>19. <i>Consistency with existing Covenants, Conditions, and Restrictions.</i></p>	<p>Consistent: The project parcel is not currently encumbered with CC&Rs.</p>

Parks and Recreation Element

Policy 9.2.3.5 regarding private sector development and maintenance of recreation facilities was reviewed by staff and the project is found to be consistent with this policy. Pursuant to policy 9.2.3.5, El Dorado County will encourage private sector development, operation, and maintenance of recreation facilities. As proposed, the equestrian center would be privately funded, developed, and operated and would provide additional recreational and tourism opportunities to El Dorado County residents and visitors.

General Plan Objective 9.3.1 states “Protect and maintain existing recreational and tourist based assets...and encourage the development of additional recreation/tourism businesses and industries” and General Plan Objective 9.3.3 states, “Actively encourage major recreational events (e.g., professional bicycle races, running events, whitewater kayaking, equestrian shows, rodeos, and athletic events) to showcase El Dorado County and increase tourism”. The project as proposed would fulfill this objective for equestrian shows as it has the potential to host major events. The project applicant managed a facility in Southern California that was a host to the 1984 Olympics.

Economic Development Element

Objective 10.1.6 states “Capture a greater share of retail and tourist dollars within the County by providing opportunities to establish new tourist-related commercial operations while promoting and

maintaining existing tourist commercial operations”. Policy 10.1.6.1 states “The County shall encourage expansion of the types of local industries that promote tourism including but not limited to Christmas tree farms, wineries, outdoor sports facilities, Apple Hill and other agricultural-related activities, the County Fairground, bed and breakfast inns, and ranch marketing activities”. Approval of this project would help towards fulfilling these objectives and policies.

The project, as proposed and conditioned is found to be consistent with the General Plan.

ZONING

The proposed uses are permitted by special use permit in the RF zone district, pursuant to Section 17.48.060.E. In order to approve the use, the approving authority must find that the use is consistent with the General Plan and would not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare nor injurious to the neighborhood. Based on the staff analysis above, comments received from public agencies and implementation of the proposed mitigation measures and conditions of approval staff believes that the project would not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare and would not be injurious to the neighborhood. After obtaining a special use permit, the proposed uses would be consistent with the provisions of the RF zone district and would provide a transition from the higher density development projected in the Community Region to the character of the adjacent area.

The proposed area of zone change from RE-10/RE-5 to RF is delineated within Exhibit F and is represented as proposed Parcel 1 of the proposed parcel map. The project would be consistent with all applicable development standards of the RF zone district as conditioned.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Staff has prepared a Mitigated Negative Declaration (Exhibit AA) to assess project-related environmental impacts. Based on the Initial Study, staff finds that the project could have a significant effect on air quality, biological resources, and cultural resources. However, the project has been modified to incorporate the mitigation measures identified in the Initial Study which will reduce the impacts to a level considered to be less than significant. Therefore, a Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared.

This project is located within or adjacent to an area which has wildlife resources (riparian lands, wetlands, watercourse, native plant life, rare plants, threatened and endangered plants or animals, etc.), and was referred to the California Department of Fish and Game. In accordance with State Legislation (California Fish and Game Code Section 711.4), the project is subject to a fee of \$2,181.25 after approval, but prior to the County filing the Notice of Determination on the project. This fee, plus a \$50.00 recording fee, is to be submitted to Planning Services and must be made payable to El Dorado County. The \$2,181.25 is forwarded to the State Department of Fish and Game and is used to help defray the cost of managing and protecting the States fish and wildlife resources.

SUPPORT INFORMATION

Attachments to Staff Report:

Conditions of Approval
Findings

Exhibit A.....	Location Map
Exhibit B.....	Assessor's Parcel Map
Exhibit C.....	General Plan Land Use Map
Exhibit D.....	Zone District Map
Exhibit E.....	Site Plan
Exhibit F.....	Applicant-submitted Project Description
Exhibit G.....	Tentative Parcel Map
Exhibit H.....	Preliminary Grading Plan
Exhibit I.....	Preliminary Utility Plan
Exhibit J.....	Preliminary Wetland Exhibit
Exhibit K.....	Slope Analysis
Exhibit L.....	Existing Tree Canopy Plan
Exhibit M.....	Preliminary Tree Preservation Plan
Exhibit N.....	Monument Sign Elevation
Exhibit O.....	Store/Office/Club Elevations
Exhibit P.....	Store/Office/Club Site Plan
Exhibit Q.....	Covered Arena Elevations
Exhibit R.....	Covered Arena Floor Plan
Exhibit S.....	Typical Stall Barn Elevations
Exhibit T1-2.....	Typical Stall Barn Floor Plan
Exhibit U.....	Typical Project Colors
Exhibit V.....	Preliminary Landscape Plan
Exhibit W1-2.....	Engineers Opinion of Cost Sewer Improvements
Exhibit X1-4.....	Oak Tree Mitigation Plan (Option A)
Exhibit Y1-7.....	Photometric and Lighting Plan
Exhibit Z.....	Cultural Resource Protection Area
Exhibit AA.....	Proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration and Initial Study