

CY 22-23  
AB 2766 PROJECT RANKING

Project Information													Cost effectiveness Ranking Criteria					
Applicant Name (In Ranking Order)	Funding Request MV Funding	Matching Funds	In-Kind Match*	Total Matching Funding	Total Project Cost	Project Life (yrs)	Lifetime Emission Reductions (lbs)	AQMD Cost Effectiveness (\$/lbs)	Total Funding Cost Effectiveness (\$/lbs)	Match Fund 20% > requested awarded fund OR ≥16.66% of the total project budget*		Rank	Cost Effectiveness AQMD Funding (45 points)	Cost Effectiveness Total Funding (25 points)	Matching Funds (25 points)	Project Feasibility (5 points)	Total	
1	<b>EDC Chamber - Stay &amp; Play Shuttle</b>	\$100,000	\$9,400	\$14,100	\$23,500	\$123,500	2	152	\$688	\$850	24%	19%	3	25	15	25	5	70
2	<b>Cameron Park CSD</b>	\$2,975	\$595	\$0	\$595	\$3,570	2	6	\$543	\$652	20%	17%	2	30	20	25	5	80
3	<b>El Dorado County Fair Shuttle</b>	\$64,000	\$11,000	\$5,000	\$16,000	\$80,000	2	44	\$1,519	\$1,889	25%	20%	4	20	15	25	5	65
4	<b>Coloma Shuttle - South Fork Arts and Recreation</b>	\$242,392	\$37,000	\$11,500	\$48,500	\$290,892	2	535	\$473	\$568	20%	17%	1	40	20	25	5	90
* match fund can be monterey or in-kind (non-dollar)																		

# AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-2023

## EDC TRANSIT AUTHORITY FAIR SHUTTLE

### General Findings

This proposal requests funding for a shuttle program to provide transportation from designated parking lots at the Library/Government Center and the WalMart parking lot at Forni Road on the 4 county fair days. From 2 to 5 transit vehicles will operate simultaneously to be scheduled and adjusted according to demand.

### Goals/Objectives

- Reduce traffic congestion on Forni Road and Placerville Drive
- Provide a safe, effective and convenient shuttle service for transportation to and from the El Dorado County Fair
- Reduce motor vehicle emissions related to congested conditions involving idling and parking close to the fair grounds
- Mitigate traffic congestion on Forni Road, Placerville Drive and HWY 50
- Reduce foot traffic on Placerville Drive thereby improving public safety
- The Scope of Work lists:
  - Shuttle service is free to public
  - Shuttle will begin providing service 30 minutes before the fair opens, and will continue until 30 minutes after the fair closes
  - Hours of service are expected to range from 150 to 225 hours depending on demand, with up to 5 transit buses with 32 passengers each
  - An ADA compliant wheelchair accessible van
  - Support and operating staff
  - Outreach and marketing
  - Signage
  - Insurance
  - AQMD funding acknowledgement
  - Coordination with county agencies and law enforcement

### Application Inputs / Results

- Funding Request: \$64,000
- Matching Funds: \$16,000 (\$11,000 Match, \$5,000 In-kind)
- The Project Life: 2 years
- Lifetime emissions reduction: 20 lbs
- Total Project Cost Effectiveness: \$3,308/lb
- AQMD Project Cost Effectiveness: \$4,115/lb

### Model Inputs and Assumptions

- Proposed project total is \$80,000, DMV funding request is \$64,000. Proposed match is 20% of total project cost and 25% of the requested funds at \$16,000. The proposal states the match will be provided by the El Dorado County Fair Association with a combination of In-Kind (marketing and advertisements) and matching funds.
- **D:** Days of Operation per Year. The shuttle didn't operate in 2020-2021 due the Covid-19 pandemic social distances restrictions. The shuttle operated 4 days in 2018, and 4 days in 2019 which results in an average of 4 days annually (D).

## AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-2023

- **R:** Ridership: One-way trips by riders or number of boardings per day. The shuttle is anticipated to return to prior to COVID-19 pandemic normal operational full capacity of 150-225 hours of passenger service. The total ridership for 2018 was reported as 10,947. Divided evenly over 4 days, R=**2,737 riders** per day.
- **L:** Auto Trip Length is the one-way length personal autos would have driven, The (L) in one direction: **4 miles** consistent with the shorter route of the Fair Shuttle.
- **Van VMT:** The 2018 VMT was 2,549 and 2019 was 2,182, average is **2,366 miles**.
- **AA:** Adjustment for auto access to and the application assumed an adjustment factor of 0.25, it is assumed that 1 in 4 people would drive to the shuttle stop.
- **LL:** trip length from auto access and from the shuttle, **5 miles** used for auto access trip length.
- **A:** Adjustment on Auto Trips is equal to portion of riders who didn't previously use transit, vanpools, or carpools. **0.95** was used for the previous years' proposals.
- Annual Emissions Reductions:  $[(\text{Annual Auto Trips Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto Trip End Factor}) + (\text{Annual Auto VMT Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto VMT Factor}) - (\text{Van VMT}) \times (\text{Van VMT Factor})] \div 454 \text{ grams to lbs} = 22 \text{ lbs per year}$

### Cost Effectiveness Calculation\*

- Cost Effectiveness results using the above inputs were:
  - Motor Vehicle Fees: **\$1,519** /pound
  - All Funding Sources: **\$1,889** /pound

### Cost Effectiveness Ranking Criteria

- AQMD Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 10, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total AQMD points are 20 out of 45
- Total project Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 5, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total points are 15 out of 25
- Matching funds are 25 points out of 25
- Project feasibility points are 5 out of 5
- Total points are: 65 out of 100

# AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

## EDC Chamber of Commerce El Dorado Stay & Play Shuttle

### General Findings

This proposal requests funding to support a shuttle program designed to encourage group transportation to regional weddings and event venues by cost-sharing. Contributions will be based on number of room nights at one or more EDC lodging. Chamber of Commerce plans to operate the shuttle year-round if the project is sufficiently funded. Eligible emissions reduced are those associated with a reduction in vehicle trips from people not driving themselves. The El Dorado Stay & Paly shuttle program is designed to address transportation and lodging concerns with regard weddings and large events.

Limitations will include:

- Lodging must be in El Dorado County
- Program funds only group of a minimum of 20 more guests
- Vacation Rentals/Airbnb are counted as one room regardless of the number of bedrooms they offer
- Operate shuttle year-around within the limitations of funding
- Transportation funding will be managed on a sliding scale w/maximum of \$1000 based on
  - 20 room nights - \$500
  - 30 room nights - \$750
  - 40 room nights - \$1000

### Goals

- Encourage group transportation and overnight stays from El Dorado County lodging to regional wedding and event venues
- Provide safe, convenient and reliable shuttle service to large volume events
- Encourage alternative methods of travel
- Reduce the number of motor vehicle emissions related to large events
- Provide education about EDC transportation options and the benefits of choosing group transportation
- Identify industry service providers willing to partner in a cost-effective way to improve environmental performance measurements of the program
- Increase awareness of emerging transportation options in El Dorado County
- Scope of work lists:
  - Update communication and marketing plan to include current objectives
  - Update landing page on [www.visiteldorado.com](http://www.visiteldorado.com) website to include elements of the 2022-23 marketing & communications plan
  - Evaluate Program, managing volunteer associated with the program and gather and report data

### Application Inputs / Results

- Funding Request: \$100,000
- Matching Funds: \$23,500 (\$9,400 match, \$14,100 In-kind)
- Useful Life: 2 years
- Lifetime Emissions Reduced: 152 lbs.
- Total Project Cost Effectiveness: \$688/lb
- AQMD Cost Effectiveness \$850/lb

# AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

## Model Inputs and Assumptions

The applicant provided the number of passengers and total shuttle miles driven for each event in 2022-2023. The model inputs are based on actual data to the maximum extent possible. In 2020, the shuttles had to reduce their capacity due the COVID-19 pandemic social distances restrictions and the program is anticipated to return to full capacity in 2022 and 2023; therefore, 2020 was excluded from calculations. The application used a prior to 2018-2019 year inputs; AQMD staff used inputs based on 2018-2019 actual data.

- **D:** Days of Operation per Year. The model was run based on average days per year.  
 $D = \text{average (2018, 2019) days of operation} = \mathbf{23}$
- **R:** Ridership: One-way trips by riders or number of boardings per day. There was only 535 riders in 2020 as the shuttles had to reduce their capacity due the COVID-19 pandemic social distances restrictions, the number of riders was calculated using 2018 and 2019 total daily number of riders  
 $R = \text{total riders} \times 2 \text{ways} / \text{total days of operation} = (5,925 + 1,111) \times 2 \div 46 = \mathbf{306}$
- **Van VMT:** Annual Van mileage, VMT for Stay & Play is averaged miles per year over 2018-2019 years of operation. VMT = **1,517 miles**
- **L:** Auto Trip Length is the one-way length personal autos would have driven. The default of **16 miles** is a good estimation of the replaced auto trip length in on direction as the 2018 and 2019 venues averaged around 16 miles from the hotel.
- **LL:** trip length from auto access and from the shuttle and it should be **0** as all shuttles leave from the hotels and no one must drive to the shuttle as they are already staying at the hotel.
- **AA:** Adjustment for auto access to and from the shuttle, AA is **0** as all people drive to the hotel, regardless of presence of a shuttle (i.e., this mileage would not change and is not being reduced).
- **A:** Adjustment on Auto Trips is equal to portion of riders who didn't previously use transit, vanpools, or carpools. **A** is **1.0** (100%) since all hotel guests are assumed to take the shuttle to/from the events.
- Annual Emissions Reductions:  $[(\text{Annual Auto Trips Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto Trip End Factor}) + (\text{Annual Auto VMT Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto VMT Factor}) - (\text{Van VMT}) \times (\text{Van VMT Factor})] \div 454 \text{ grams to lbs} = \mathbf{76 \text{ lbs per year}}$

## Cost Effectiveness Calculations\*

- Cost Effectiveness results using the above inputs were:
  - Motor Vehicle Fees: **\$688/pound**
  - All Funding Sources: **\$850/pound**

## Cost Effectiveness Ranking Criteria

- AQMD Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 25, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total AQMD points are 35 out of 45
- Total project Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 5, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total points are 15 out of 25
- Matching funds are 25 points out of 25
- Project feasibility points are 5 out of 5
- Total points are:70

# AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

## CAMERON PARK COMMUNITY SERVICES DISTRICT SUMMER SPECTACULAR SHUTTLE

### General Findings

Shuttle service for the annual Summer Spectacular at Cameron Park Lake. Annual attendance is estimated at 4,000. Buses will travel once an hour from 2PM to 11PM on or near July 4<sup>th</sup>. Two buses each capable of holding 84 people will travel the 13.8 mile round trip for a total of 248.4 miles. An estimated 75 people will ride the bus every hour for a total of 1,350 people.

### Application Inputs / Results

- Funding Request: \$2,975
- Matching Funds: \$595 (\$0 In-kind)
- The Project Life: 2 yrs
- Lifetime emissions reduction: 6 lbs
- Total Project Cost Effectiveness: \$543/lb
- AQMD Project Cost Effectiveness: \$652/lb

### Model Inputs and Assumptions

The application used a prior year inputs; AQMD staff used inputs based on actual data and corrected default factors that were used.

- **D:** Days of Operation per Year = 1
- **R:** Ridership: One-way trips by riders or number of boardings per day.  $R = (75 \times 9 \text{ hours} \times 2 \text{ buses}) = 1,350 \text{ riders per day}$
- **Van VMT:** Annual Van mileage, the buses travelled approximately **270 miles** per day.
- **L:** Auto Trip Length is the one-way length personal autos would have driven. The default of **16 miles** is a good estimation of the replaced auto trip.
- **LL:** trip length from auto access and from the shuttle and the default of **2 miles**.
- **AA:** Adjustment for auto access to and from the shuttle, AA is **0.5** is a default for shuttles.
- **A:** Adjustment on Auto Trips is equal to portion of riders who didn't previously use transit, vanpools, or carpools. **0.3** is the correct default factor.
- Annual Emissions Reductions:  $[(\text{Annual Auto Trips Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto Trip End Factor}) + (\text{Annual Auto VMT Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto VMT Factor}) - (\text{Van VMT}) \times (\text{Van VMT Factor})] \div 454 \text{ grams to lbs} = 3 \text{ lbs per year}$

### Cost Effectiveness Calculation\*

- Cost Effectiveness results using the above inputs were:
  - Motor Vehicle Fees: **\$543/pound**
  - All Funding Sources: **\$652/pound**

### Cost Effectiveness Ranking Criteria

- AQMD Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 20, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total AQMD points are 30 out of 45
- Total project Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 10, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total points are 20 out of 25
- Matching funds are 25 points out of 25
- Project feasibility points are 5 out of 5

## AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

- Total points are: 80 out of 100

# AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

## South Fork Arts and Recreation Shuttle (SoFAR)

### General Findings

This proposal requests funding for a shuttle program designed to provide transportation on 270 days of service (over 2 years) along the south fork of the American River from the Ice-House put-in to the Skunk Hollow take-out. Additionally, shuttle service will be developed for other activities on the regional trail systems along the river corridor including mountain biking & hiking. Eligible emissions reduced are those associated with a reduction in vehicle trips from people not driving themselves.

### Goals/Objectives

- Provide an effective and convenient shuttle service for recreational users along the South Fork American River from Ice House Reservoir to Skunk Hollow including river runners, hikers, and bikers
- Continue to expand the shuttle services to accommodate other river corridor users and their shuttle needs
- Reduce motor vehicle emissions related to river corridor recreation
- Continue to promote parking in appropriate parking locations in the Coloma and Lotus business district to encourage economic benefits to the merchants and reduce impacts of parking on put-in and take-out spots with reduced parking capacities
- Increase ridership over 2018 and 2019, as well as 2020 and 2021
- Develop & market shuttle service for the new recreational flows on South Fork Silver Creek below Ice House Reservoir and South Fork American River below Slab Creek Reservoir
- Develop & market shuttle service for mountain biking and hiking on the regional trail systems along the river corridor.
- Reduce the annual cost per rider by increasing ridership and decreasing costs
- Reduce motor vehicle emissions related to river corridor recreation
- Provide incentive to return to the merchants in the Coloma/Lotus area and redistribute parking impacts by encouraging riders to park in the Coloma/Lotus area and catch the shuttle at the beginning of the day or end of the day.

### Application Inputs / Results

- Funding Request: \$242,392
- Matching Funds: \$48,500 (\$37,000 Match, \$11,500 In-kind)
- Useful Life: 2 years
- Lifetime Emissions Reduced: 535 lbs.
- Total Project Cost Effectiveness: \$473 /lb
- AQMD Cost Effectiveness \$568 /lb

### Model Inputs and Assumptions

- Proposed project total is \$290,892, DMV funding request is \$242,392. Proposed match is 17% of total project cost and 20% of the requested funds at \$48,500. The proposal states the match will be provided by the applicant and is expected to be generated from revenue and in-kind donations of free shuttles from community events.



- **D:** Days of Operation per Year. The shuttle operated 282 days in 2018-2019, 188 days in 2020-2021, and is anticipated to be operated 270 in 2022-2023. The application double counted as the calculations are designed on an annual basis but numbers for 2 years were used. Days (D) of operation should be **135 per year** for 270 total.
- **R:** Ridership: One-way trips by riders or number of boardings per day. In 2020-2021, the SoFar shuttle didn't operate until late into the summer and had to reduce their capacity to half due the Covid-19 pandemic social distances restrictions. The Sofar is anticipated to return to prior to COVID-19 pandemic normal operational full capacity of 13-14 rides per shuttle and the number of riders is expected to increase given the amount of demand the project has seen in previous years. As such, 2018 and 2019 were used in the calculations.  $R = (\text{average (2018, 2019, anticipated 2022, 2023) total number of riders} \div \text{annual operating days}) = 37(\text{total trips (riders)/day})$
- There are three river routes: Chili Bar-Gorge, Ice House, and Slab Creek
  1. Chili Bar=11.2 mi and Gorge=13.5 mi , round trip Coloma to El Dorado County (EDC) Line = 40 mi
  2. Ice House = 11 mi, round trip Ice House to EDC Line = 110 mi
  3. Slab Creek = 18.7, round trip Slab Creek to EDC Line = 60mi
- **L:** Auto Trip Length is the one-way length personal autos would have driven, The (L) in one direction for each is as follows:
  1. Chili Bar-Gorge =  $11.2 + 13.5 + (40 \div 2) = 44.7$  mi
  2. Ice House =  $11.2 + (110 \div 2) = 66.2$  mi
  3. Slab Creek =  $18.7 + (60 \div 2) = 48.7$  mi

The project has 3 vehicles but due to the current drought situation, the shuttle is anticipated to operate the standard shuttle route; therefore, 2 vehicles was used in the calculations:  $L = ((13.5 \text{ mi} + 11.2) + (40 \div 2)) \times 2 = 89.40$  mi
- **Van VMT:** Annual Van mileage = (#of vehicles x D x Route length x 2 ways):  $VMT = (2 \times 135 \times 24.7 \times 2) = 13,338$  mi
- **AA:** Adjustment for auto access to and from the shuttle is reasonable at 40% of the riders who drive to and from the shuttle = **0.4**
- **LL:** trip length from auto access and from the shuttle, **5 miles** used for auto access trip length.
- **A:** Adjustment on Auto Trips is equal to portion of riders who didn't previously use transit, vanpools, or carpools. 1 was used for the previous years' proposals.
- Annual Emissions Reductions:  $[(\text{Annual Auto Trips Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto Trip End Factor}) + (\text{Annual Auto VMT Reduced}) \times (\text{Auto VMT Factor}) - (\text{Van VMT}) \times (\text{Van VMT Factor})] \div 454 \text{ grams to lbs} = 268 \text{ lbs per year}$

#### Cost Effectiveness Calculation\*

- Cost Effectiveness results using the above inputs were:
  - Motor Vehicle Fees: **\$473/pound**
  - All Funding Sources: **\$568/pound**

#### Cost Effectiveness Ranking Criteria

- AQMD Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 30, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total AQMD points are 40 out of 45
- Total project Cost Effectiveness points for 2-year life is 10, preferred points for Shuttle are 10, total points are 20 out of 25
- Matching funds are 25 points out of 25
- Project feasibility points are 5 out of 5

## AB 2766 Grant Applications Ranking Discussion and Justification 2022-23

- Total points are: 90 out of 100