

**COUNTY OF EL DORADO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
PLANNING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**



Agenda of: April 27, 2017

Staff: Aaron Mount

REZONE/CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT/PARCEL MAP

FILE NUMBERS: Z04-0015/S01-0011/P08-0036/Springs Equestrian Center

APPLICANT: Dennis Graham

AGENT: TSD Engineering/Casey Feickert

REQUEST: The project consists of the following requests:

1. Tentative Parcel Map to create three parcels, 38.27 acres (Parcel 1), 102.47 acres (Parcel 2), and 5.63 acres (Parcel 3) in size;
2. Rezone from Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5) to Recreational Facilities, Low Intensity (RF-L) for Parcel 1 only; and
3. Conditional Use Permit for an equestrian facility with two covered arenas 45,000 square feet each, stall barns for 300 horses, five fenced riding areas, 8,000 square-foot equestrian retail store/office/clubhouse, campground for horse trailers during events, special events with up to 250 spectators, and an eight foot tall by nine foot wide monument sign with 48 square feet of display area.

LOCATION: South side of Green Valley Road, at the intersection with Deer Valley Road, in the Rescue area, Supervisorial District 1. (Exhibit A)

APN: 115-410-05 (Exhibit B)

ACREAGE: 146.38± acres

GENERAL PLAN: Low Density Residential (LDR) (Exhibit C)

ZONING: Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5) (Exhibit D)

ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT: Mitigated Negative Declaration (Exhibit AA)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Planning Commission recommend that the Board of Supervisors take the following actions:

1. Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration based on the Initial Study prepared by staff;
2. Adopt the mitigation monitoring program in accordance with California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Section 15074(d), as incorporated in the Conditions of Approval and mitigation measures;
3. Approve Z04-0015 to rezone proposed Parcel 1 from Estate Residential Five-Acre (RE-5) to Recreational Facilities, Low Intensity (RF-L) based on the Findings;
4. Approve Parcel Map P08-0036 based on the Findings and subject to the Conditions of Approval; and
5. Approve Conditional Use Permit S01-0011 based on the Findings and subject to the Conditions of Approval.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Staff has reviewed the project for compliance with the County's regulations and requirements. An analysis of the proposal and issues for Planning Commission consideration are provided in the following sections:

Background

The project was continued off calendar at the July 26, 2012 and the October 23, 2014 Planning Commission (Commission) hearings in order for the applicant to provide the Commission additional information on the following issues: asbestos, wetlands, noise, emergency access and egress, vehicle traffic used to remove horse waste removal, water usage and quality, campground noise, traffic impacts, generators and lights, grading on-site, filling of ponds, special events, and hours of operation.

Major changes made to the project description by the applicant since the last Commission hearing include:

1. Reduction in the number of horses from 425 to 300.

2. Reduction in the size of the equestrian retail store/office/clubhouse from 12,000 square feet to 8,000 square feet and from two stories to a single story.
3. Deer Valley Road will be an entrance only for a majority of the equestrian center traffic.
4. The proposed exit onto Green Valley Road at the east end of the property will be used for a majority of the traffic exiting the equestrian portion of the facility.
5. Wedding receptions or any non-equestrian events with amplified music will be held within a fully enclosed structure.
6. The wedding/non-equestrian event number per week has been reduced from 4-6 per week to four per month with at least one weekend per month free of events.
7. Water quality will be measured annually at the creek to monitor compliance pursuant to a submitted water quality program.
8. A grass berm will be provided in front of the creek to collect any run off.
9. Deliveries of supplies such as bedding and feed, as well as hauling of manure will be scheduled for mid-day (e.g. 9AM-3PM) Monday-Friday to ensure residents are not disturbed by these activities.

Site Description

The 146 acre project site lies at an elevation of approximately 1,100 feet above mean sea level and is comprised of gently rolling terrain. Vegetation communities present on-site include Valley oak woodland, valley/foothill riparian, annual grassland, wet meadow, and mixed chaparral. Adjacent land uses include single-family estate and rural residences, a middle school, undeveloped lands and paved roadways. Current access is from an existing driveway into the site from Deer Valley Road. Existing improvements include two single family residences and various agricultural structures.

Adjacent Land Uses

	Zoning	General Plan	Land Use/Improvements
Site	RE-5	LDR	Residential/ Single-Family Residences & Undeveloped
North	RE-5/ RE-10/ TC/RL-10	RR/LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences & Undeveloped
South	RE-5	LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences
East	RE-5	PF/LDR	School Site & Residential
West	RE-5	LDR	Residential/Single-Family Residences

Discussion: The project is located in the western most portion of the Cameron Park Community Region. The project parcel is bounded on the west and south by estate sized residential land uses, to the east by a middle school, and to the north by Green Valley Road, which separates it from rural and residential uses in the Rural Region (See Exhibit C).

Project Description

The project includes a Tentative Parcel Map, Rezone, and Conditional Use Permit proposed as follows:

I. Tentative Parcel Map: Tentative Parcel Map to create three parcels, 38.27 acres (Parcel 1), 102.47 acres (Parcel 2), and 5.63 acres (Parcel 3) in size.

II. Rezone: The rezone would change the parcel from RE-5 to Recreational Facilities, Low Intensity (RF-L) for proposed Parcel 1, only. Parcels 2 and 3 of the site would remain RE-5 with no development proposed at this time.

III. Conditional Use Permit: The Conditional Use Permit would allow construction of an equestrian center on Parcel 1 (Exhibit E) with the following features:

- a. Boarding/grooming stalls for 300 horses.
- b. Two covered arenas 45,000 square feet each.
- c. 45,000 square-foot fenced arena.
- d. 37,500 square foot fenced arena.
- e. 31,250 square foot fenced arena.
- f. Three 80-stall barns; one 40-stall barn; one 20-stall barn. Horses are kept in 12 foot by 12 foot box stall barns or in 12 foot by 24 foot pipe stall barns. Barn stalls will be painted aluminum with a composite panel interior. Concrete pier footing will be provided on all construction. Architectural metal roofing will be coated in hunter green paint and the barn siding will be coated in beige paint.
- g. Five circular horse hotwalk areas.
- h. 97,350 square foot grass arena.
- i. 8,000 square-foot equestrian retail store/office/clubhouse/fitness center. The retail store will consist of approximately 2,000 square feet, the fitness center will consist of approximately 2,000 square feet, and the office/conference rooms will consist of approximately 4,000 square feet. Non-member entry to the clubhouse will be prior to the equestrian entrance gate.
- j. An eight foot tall unlit-monument sign with approximately 48 square feet of display area (Exhibit N).
- k. An existing 3,600 square-foot residence to be used as a management residence and office.
- l. Forty-space camping area for horse trailers and recreational vehicles equipped with electrical and water hook-up outlets. These facilities would be an extension of the horse shows and is not intended to be a full time campground. Maximum occupancy would be 90 people and maximum length of stay would be ten days to coincide with the length of horse shows. Forty occupied trailer spaces are identified, no generators will be allowed, and no sewer connection will be provided. RV and trailer exit will be provided onto Green Valley Road during all horse shows.
- m. Main road. The main entrance will have two gates, one for entering and one for leaving. The main road is routed through the equestrian center and will extend from Deer Valley Road to the far side of the property onto Green Valley Road which will be the primary exit. Deer

Valley Road will be an entrance only for all equestrian facility traffic except for the following:

1. Emergency egress
 2. Visitors visiting the clubhouse.
 3. Residents of the project parcels.
 4. Employees of the equestrian facility.
 5. Vehicles not able to use the egress onto Green Valley Road due to physical constraints.
- n. Interior roadway circulation is typically closed to car and truck traffic, except for equipment loading and unloading. Some interior roadways will be provided for car access to the barns. Speed limit is 5 MPH.
 - o. A total of 198 parking spaces.
 - p. An existing 1,058 square-foot single-unit residence on proposed Parcel 3; 5,000 square-foot storage building; hay storage service area; and three other minor accessory structures are currently located on the subject property and would remain as part of this project.
 - q. The equestrian center will be fenced with ranch fencing around its entire exterior perimeter. White rail PVC fencing will outline many working areas within the equestrian center. Horse arenas will be made from three-rail white PVC fencing.
 - r. No outside arena lighting. Interior lighting within the covered arenas to be reflected downward and not visible from the perimeter of the property.
 - s. After annexation into EID's service area, the residences and mobile homes will be connected to public water. Public water will be the sole source for all barn and building use along with horse watering. Public water will be the sole source for fire suppression systems.
 - t. Septic systems currently on the property will provide for waste water disposal at the main house and mobile homes. A new septic system will be installed for the clubhouse, event building, and horse wash stalls.
 - u. A monument sign or plaque may be placed to designate special species of plants and non-sensitive artifacts throughout the property.
 - v. One 4,000 square foot single-unit residence.

The following uses are being proposed for the equestrian center:

1. The proposed equestrian center would include approximately 32 staff members.
Management: The facility manager will oversee all accounting, boarding agreements, horse shows, and general operations. The facility management team will continue to reside at the facility to provide a 24 hour presence, seven days per week. A point of contact will be provided and published. A 24 hour phone answering service will be provided with a live person contact, for immediate or emergency access. An email address will be provided for written contact and communication.
Staff: One stall hand for every 40 stalls boarded to provide the daily stall mucking and removal (2 times per day) and general cleaning. One person per 100 horses for feeding (2 times per day) and providing shavings. Two grounds personnel for general maintenance and security. Additional facility personnel will be obtained as conditions warrant. The management team will include clerical staff, retail store staff, show staff, safety and ground

inspection staff. The number of administration and staff employees will vary as conditions warrant. Seasonal staff will be obtained for horse shows, weddings, and special events.

2. Hours of operation are 7:00 AM to 10:00 PM seven days a week for the equestrian center.
3. The retail store shall be for members only and shall not be available to the public. The members/boarders will have immediate access to purchase equine care products, feed, vitamins, supplements, grooming products, tack, apparel, and riding equipment. Hours of operation will be within the equestrian center hours.
4. The fitness facility shall be for members only and shall not be available to the public and will provide for physical strengthening. The facility will not contain a salon, spa, nor a shower area. Hours of operation will be within the equestrian center hours and will be closed during horse shows.
5. Offices will provide space for administration, accounting, and management. Office hours are 6 am to 6 pm Monday through Friday and closed on weekends.
6. Seminars will be conducted and located in the conference rooms of the clubhouse office area and will provide for continuing education, conferences, and meetings. The conference rooms may be made available to local clubs and community organizations for meetings and events in support of special needs. The size of each class will not exceed 30 people, generally held in the evenings from 6 pm to 9 pm.
7. Horse Shows:
 - 12-18 per year to include 2 annual shows
 - Regular shows run two days, typically Saturday and Sunday 8 am to 6 pm.
 - Annual shows run four to eight days (2 shows maximum per year), typically Saturday through the following Sunday from 8 am to 6 pm.
 - Horse Shows will consist of English, Equitation/Pleasure, Dressage, and others. Sound announcement will be conducted at soft non-horse alarming levels, with simple commands for Equitation/Pleasure Classes such as “turn your horses”, pause then, “jog your horses”, etc. All other Shows do not require sound announcement during their performances.
 - The required workers would be 1-4 show judges and administrative staff of 4-6 people.
 - Attendees are to be primarily internal, if fully boarded.
 - Horse shows will be narrated by microphone and a speaker system within the covered and open arenas.
8. Weddings:
 - To be held Friday 5 pm to 9:30 pm, Saturday 10 am to 9:30 pm, and Sunday 10 am to 9 pm.
 - Weddings shall be prohibited during horse shows and events.
 - Maximum: Four per month and maximum 150 people per wedding.
 - One weekend per month with no weddings.
 - Wedding ceremonies will be conducted on the grass in front of the existing main house and in the covered arena.
 - The reception will be held in a fully enclosed facility if amplified music is to be played.
9. Special events:
 - Events to be held during facility hours and shall end before 9:30 pm.
 - A maximum of 6 special events per year.
 - Events shall not be held during weddings or horse shows.
 - One weekend per month with no special events.

10. Maximum occupancy of the site shall be 300 people at any one time.
11. Open or uncovered arenas are groomed daily to keep the footing (sand base footing) workable for the rider and eliminates dust within the arena. Proper grooming consists of watering the arena area in the morning (6 am to 8 am). During summer months, arena will be watered an additional time at mid-day.
12. Covered arenas are for use year round and during any rain periods. Hours of operation will be 7 am to 9 pm.
13. Feed delivery is two to three times per month to the existing hay storage barn.
14. Site trash removal and clean-up is a minimum of twice per day. A commercial carrier picks up the trash containers as scheduled, or at a minimum of once per week.
15. Horse stall are cleaned twice per day, seven days per week. The manure and soiled bedding is gathered together along with any waste and placed into a commercial 45 yard bin. The bin is covered and keeps the manure in a sealed environment. Common areas are cleaned daily of any droppings and placed into the manure containers.
16. All box stall barns will be equipped with an automatic fly control system from which a fly control solution is automatically sprayed. Barns will also have large agricultural air movement fans.
17. An air purification system is installed in each barn to retain and discard odors.
18. Equipment used daily at the equestrian center will consist of simple farm and ranch implements.
19. All speakers will be designed and placed to direct all sounds away from the neighboring residential uses and will reduce power in the speakers output to be consistent with the Noise Ordinance standards (130.37). The facility staff shall measure and monitor all noise levels during the horse shows to ensure compliance.

A Phasing plan is proposed, as follows:

Equestrian Center

- 1st year – Commence required common area improvements.
- 2nd year – Commence two arenas, and boarding for 40 horses.
- 3rd year – Commence one arena, and boarding for 80 new horses.
- 4th year – Commence one arena, and boarding for 80 new horses
- 5th year – Commence one arena, and boarding for 100 new horses.

Clubhouse

Commence in 2nd year, complete in 3rd year.

The project would also include the annexation of proposed parcels 1 and 3 into the El Dorado Irrigation District (EID) for the provision of public water. A water line extension is required from the existing water line in Green Valley Road. Sewage disposal will be by individual septic systems.

General Plan/Zoning Ordinance Discussion

I. Tentative Parcel Map P08-0036

The project includes a request for a Tentative Parcel Map to create three parcels: 38.27 acres (Parcel 1), 102.47 acres (Parcel 2), and 5.63 acres (Parcel 3) in size. Parcel 1 would contain the equestrian center, Parcel 2 would remain undeveloped, and Parcel 3 would contain an existing residence. The parcel sizes are consistent with the existing General Plan land use designation of Low Density Residential and proposed zone districts.

II. Rezone Z04-0015

General Plan:

The project contains a request to rezone proposed Parcel 1 to Recreational Facilities, Low-Intensity, consistent with Table 2-4 of the General Plan for the land use designation of Low Density Residential.

Policy 2.2.5.3. Staff has reviewed the zone change request against the 19 specific criteria under this policy and found that the proposal is consistent with applicable criteria such as availability and capacity of the public treated water system, capacity of the transportation system serving the area and existing land use pattern, as follows:

Criteria	Consistency
1. <i>Availability of an adequate public water source or an approved Capital Improvement Project to increase service for existing land use demands.</i>	Consistent: As discussed above in the Water Supply section in <i>Project Issues</i> , the project would be conditioned to have a safe and reliable water supply on each parcel prior to filing the Parcel Map. The project would require annexation into the EID to obtain the necessary water supply.
2. <i>Availability and capacity of public treated water system</i>	Consistent: As discussed above in the Water Supply section in <i>Project Issues</i> , the project would rely on EID public water for potable water service. The project would require annexation into the EID utilities district before meters can be purchased.
3. <i>Availability and capacity of public waste water treatment system.</i>	Consistent: The project would utilize septic facilities for waste water.
4. <i>Distance to and capacity of the serving elementary and high school.</i>	Consistent: The existing project area is currently served by the Rescue Union School District and is directly adjacent to a middle school.
5. <i>Response time from nearest fire station handling structure fires.</i>	Consistent: There are two fire stations within approximately three miles of the proposed facility. The Rescue Fire Protection District (District) would be responsible for serving the project area for structure fires. The El Dorado Hills Fire Department for the District has

	recommended conditions of approval that would require the project adhere to the applicable building and fire codes, as well as conditions of approval regarding the execution of the District's Fire Safe regulations. The fulfillment of those recommended conditions would address the fire related safety issues identified by the District.
6. <i>Distance to nearest Community Region or Rural Center.</i>	Consistent: The project site is located within the Cameron Park Community Region.
7. <i>Erosion hazard.</i>	Consistent: The project would require grading for roads and drainage infrastructure to be completed prior to filing the Parcel Map or initiation of use. This would assure that all existing drainage courses would be adequately protected by the incorporation of appropriate development setbacks and the required strict adherence to Best Management practices during the grading permit process.
8. <i>Septic and leach field capability.</i>	Consistent: The Environmental Health Division has found there would be suitable area on each proposed parcel for adequate sewage disposal.
9. <i>Groundwater capability to support wells.</i>	Consistent: The project proposes connection to a public water system. Annexation to EID would be required before the connection could be established. A naturally occurring spring may be used for agricultural and landscaping uses. The County has determined that it has no jurisdiction over non-potable uses of a spring that the property owner has water rights to.
10. <i>Critical flora and fauna habitat areas.</i>	Consistent: A Revised Final Biological Resources Study (Springs Ranch Equestrian Center, El Dorado County, Special Status Plant Species Assessment, Ecorp Consulting, October 24, 2016) was submitted by the applicant that included the results of a survey of special status and locally significant plants and animals and suitable habitat for the same. The report was requested as the previous study was greater than five years old. New species that may have potential habitat on the site were identified through a literature review. All critical flora and fauna would be avoided and no new impacts were identified.
11. <i>Important timber production areas.</i>	Consistent: The project site does not contain nor is adjacent to any important timber production areas.
12. <i>Important agricultural areas.</i>	Consistent: This property and project is not under and would not conflict with an adjacent Williamson Act Contract and is located within an area which does not contain, nor is it directly adjacent to, lands zoned and

	designated by the General Plan to be preserved for agricultural use.
13. <i>Important mineral resource areas.</i>	Consistent: The project site does not contain nor is located adjacent to any important mineral resource areas.
14. <i>Capacity of the transportation system serving the area.</i>	Consistent: The Transportation Division reviewed the submitted traffic studies and concluded that the recommended conditions of approval, including improvements to existing roadways, would sufficiently address traffic issues and ensure that the transportation system is adequate to serve the area.
15. <i>Existing land use pattern.</i>	Consistent: The project site is surrounded by land designated and utilized for low-density and estate residential uses on three sides and is adjacent to a middle school on the other. The proposed parcel map would allow the creation of parcels which would be consistent with the LDR land use designations as well as the existing land use and parcel size pattern of the surrounding parcels.
16. <i>Proximity to perennial watercourse.</i>	Consistent: There were no perennial watercourses identified within the project parcel. Sweetwater Creek, the closest perennial stream, lies approximately one mile north of the project parcel. Green Springs Creek runs through the project parcel and is an intermittent watercourse.
17. <i>Important historical/archeological sites.</i>	Consistent: A cultural resources study prepared by Peak & Associates, Inc. July 8, 2005 was completed for the subject parcel and reported there were two identified archaeological sites on the project site. Mitigation measures to ensure protection of the sites have been added to the project and are discussed in the Cultural Resource section of the Initial Study. An additional study reviewed the potential for a cemetery and found no evidence. Because of the possibility in the future that ground disturbances could discover significant cultural resources, staff has added standard conditions of approval and a mitigation measure for the cemetery to assure that potential issue is addressed during project development.
18. <i>Seismic hazards and present of active faults.</i>	Consistent: As shown in the Division of Mines and Geology's publication, <i>Fault Rupture Hazard Zones in California</i> , there are no Alquist-Priolo Special Studies Zones mapped in the west slope of El Dorado County. The impacts from fault ruptures, seismically induced ground shaking, seismic ground failure, or liquefaction are considered to be less than significant. Any potential impact caused by locating buildings in the project area

	would be offset by the compliance with the Uniform Building Code earthquake standards.
19. <i>Consistency with existing Covenants, Conditions, and Restrictions.</i>	Consistent: The project parcel is not currently encumbered with CC&Rs.

Zoning Ordinance

The proposed uses are permitted by conditional use permit in the Recreational Facilities, Low-Intensity (RF-L) zone district, pursuant to Section 130.25.020.

III. Conditional Use Permit S01-0011

General Plan:

Policy 2.2.1.2. The subject site has a Low Density Residential (LDR) General Plan land use designation. This land use designation is appropriate within Community Regions where higher density serving infrastructure is not yet available. Public water and access to a County maintained road are available and public sewer is not necessary at this time. While the development’s density is not consistent with the urban/suburban densities anticipated in a Community Region, compatibility can be demonstrated with economic policies regarding tourism and recreational activities as discussed below.

Policy 2.2.5.21. The subject site is surrounded by rural residential uses, Pleasant Grove Middle School, and the approved subdivision Silver Springs to the east and Serrano and Bass Lake Hills Specific Plan to the South and west. Additional residential development has been approved north of the subject site across Green Valley Road. Several mitigation measures and standard conditions of approval concerning exterior lighting, dust and fly control, odor, noise, traffic and hours of operation are recommended. Compliance with these mitigation measures and conditions of approval would address any potential land use incompatibility issues with adjoining existing and future land uses. Therefore, the proposed project would be compatible within the context of these surrounding land uses pursuant to General Plan Policy 2.2.5.21.

Policy 7.4.4.4. Existing oak tree canopy coverage is estimated at 19.05 percent or 27.9 acres of the site (Proposed Oak Tree Mitigation Plan for the Springs Ranch Equestrian Center, Kurt Stegen, March 7, 2012). As proposed, 5.48 percent or 1.53 acres of the existing oak canopy is to be removed consistent with the Interim Interpretive Guidelines for El Dorado County General Plan Policy 7.4.4.4 that allows the removal of up to 10 percent of the existing oak canopy. A replanting plan has been submitted that is consistent with Option A of the Interim Interpretive Guidelines for El Dorado County General Plan Policy 7.4.4.4. The project as proposed is consistent with the oak tree canopy protection and replacement requirements of General Plan Policy 7.4.4.4 and the Interim Interpretive Guidelines Amended October 12, 2007.

Parks and Recreation Element

Pursuant to policy 9.2.3.5, El Dorado County will encourage private sector development, operation, and maintenance of recreation facilities. As proposed, the equestrian center would be privately funded, developed, and operated and would provide additional recreational and tourism opportunities to El Dorado County residents and visitors.

General Plan Objective 9.3.1 states “Protect and maintain existing recreational and tourist based assets...and encourage the development of additional recreation/tourism businesses and industries” and General Plan Objective 9.3.3 states, “Actively encourage major recreational events (e.g., professional bicycle races, running events, whitewater kayaking, equestrian shows, rodeos, and athletic events) to showcase El Dorado County and increase tourism”. The project as proposed would fulfill this objective for equestrian shows as it has the potential to host major events. The project applicant managed a similar facility in Southern California that was a host to equestrian events in the 1984 Summer Olympics.

Economic Development Element

Objective 10.1.6 states “Capture a greater share of retail and tourist dollars within the County by providing opportunities to establish new tourist-related commercial operations while promoting and maintaining existing tourist commercial operations”. Policy 10.1.6.1 states “The County shall encourage expansion of the types of local industries that promote tourism including but not limited to ..., outdoor sports facilities,...”. Approval of this project would help towards fulfilling these objectives and policies by promoting tourism.

Zoning Ordinance:

Zoning Ordinance Section 130.40.210.C states that “Stables that provide horses for hire at an hourly, daily or weekly rate, commercial boarding and training of horses, or riding lessons that exceed the standards of a home occupation shall be subject to the following minimum standards”:

<p>1. Minimum Lot Size. 10 acres.</p>	<p>Consistent: The equestrian facility would be located on a proposed parcel 38.27 acres in size.</p>
<p>2. Setbacks. Under this Subsection, commercial stables, barns, and other structures used for or intended to be used for the sheltering of horses and/or other animals shall comply with the setback requirements of the zone in which they are located, except that the minimum setback from any residentially-zoned property shall be 100 feet.</p>	<p>Consistent: All commercial stables, barns, and other structures used for or intended to be used for the sheltering of horses would be a minimum of 200 feet from any residentially zoned property.</p>
<p>3. Parking and Loading. Horse trailer parking spaces required under Chapter 130.35 (Parking and Loading) shall be located a minimum of 50 feet from any public road or right-of-way.</p>	<p>Consistent: Horse trailer parking would be a minimum of 400 feet from any public right-of-way.</p>
<p>4. Arenas. Training arenas shall have a minimum setback of 100 feet from any</p>	<p>Consistent: All training arenas would be a minimum of 100 feet from any residentially</p>

<p>residentially-zoned property. Arenas used for shows or events where more than 10 people could congregate at any one time shall be subject to a Conditional Use Permit in compliance with Section 130.52.020 (Conditional and Minor Use Permits).</p>	<p>zoned property. The project includes Conditional Use Permit application S01-0011.</p>
<p>5. Equestrian Trails. Prior to Department approval of a permit for a commercial stable where the public may be riding off of the premises, the applicant shall demonstrate access to a trail easement for equestrian purposes. Proposed commercial stables adjacent to trail easements may be required to dedicate land for trail access points, as determined by the Director.</p>	<p>Consistent: No equestrian trails are proposed.</p>

Issues:

Access

Primary site access would be provided off Deer Valley Road, a privately-maintained road. An exit only access will be provided onto Green Valley Road and would be the primary egress. Proposed off-site road improvements are discussed in the circulation section below. These points of ingress/egress would allow all users and emergency responders to enter and exit the project site and have been designed to ensure ingress and egress of vehicles pulling horse trailers. In addition, the project's internal roadways would comply with fire safe standards as the El Dorado Hills Fire Department and Rescue Fire Protection District have reviewed the project and confirmed that the two encroachments and on-site roadways are adequate for the development.

Building Design

Preliminary elevations for the proposed retail store/clubhouse/office, shown on the northwest corner of the site plan, are attached as Exhibit O. Preliminary elevations for the 60-and 80-stall barns as well as the covered arena are also included in Exhibits Q and S. Typical project colors are attached as Exhibit U for the stalls, barns, and covered arenas. The retail store/office/club house would have wood siding painted light brown with dark brown trim and the roof would consist of dark brown tile. Staff reviewed the proposed building elevations, materials, height, colors and overall appearance and concluded that they would be consistent with the applicable zoning district regulations and community design standards. The Rescue Fire Protection District (RFPD) required a maximum of 31 feet in height on four sides of the buildings as this is the maximum reach of their equipment. The retail store/office/club house building has been redesigned to a single story structure and therefore meets this height requirement. Additionally, all building plans would be reviewed at the building permit application stage by the El Dorado Hills Fire District for the Rescue Fire Protection District.

Landscaping

Staff reviewed the preliminary landscape plan, Exhibit V, and determined that it would meet the requirements contained in the Zoning Ordinance and Community Design Standards for Landscaping and Irrigation. The overall landscape plan takes into account the proposed recreational use and open space areas. The applicant would need to submit a final landscape plan at time of building permit submittal that would be reviewed by Development Services staff. Additionally, staff would make an on-site inspection to verify compliance with the final landscape plan prior to occupancy.

Lighting

A review of the project's photometric evaluation and lighting plans (Exhibit Y1-7) indicate that the proposed arena lighting and exterior barn lighting would be consistent with the County's Outdoor Lighting Ordinance (Section 130.34). All lighting would be required to be fully shielded so as to prevent lighting glare onto adjacent properties. The proposed lighting is clustered in the northwest corner of the 146 acre project parcel making it highly unlikely that the proposed lighting would spill over onto adjacent properties. Final photometric plans would be required at the building permit application stage to ensure compliance with the County's Lighting Ordinance.

Noise

The project previously proposed outside events including weddings with amplified music. The project has been revised to include an event building that will house any events that propose amplified music and speech. Any outdoor weddings or events will not have outdoor amplification and would have receptions within this new proposed event building. Overnight parking of trailers and recreational vehicles would only be available during horse shows and special events and would have electrical hook ups so that no generators need to be used. The noise analysis concluded that this use would be consistent with County noise requirements. The recommended monitoring program will ensure full compliance with County noise standards.

Parking

Section 130.35.030.C of the Zoning Ordinance requires that where combinations of uses are proposed on a single site that parking shall be calculated for each separate use. Parking requirements for the proposed use are addressed within Table 130.35.030.1 of the Zoning Ordinance. The Ordinance requires one parking space per four stalls which at the proposed build-out of 300 stalls would require 75 parking spaces. Additionally the project proposes events with up to 250 attendees which would require 100 parking spaces, for a total of 175 required spaces. The project proposes to provide 198 total parking spaces including 40 occupied trailer spaces. The applicant anticipates that attendees of the events would mainly be those that are boarding horses at the facility. Therefore, the proposed parking areas with a total of 198 developed spaces would provide sufficient parking for the proposed use.

Signage

As shown in Exhibit N, the applicant has proposed a monument sign at the southeast corner of the intersection of Green Valley Road and Deer Valley Road. The sign would be eight feet tall and nine feet wide with approximately 48 square feet of display area. Proposed sign materials include heavy timber and a rock base. As shown on Exhibit M the sign display areas of Panels A, B, and C are a

total of 48 square feet. The applicant has agreed to not add lighting to the sign consistent with the Sign Ordinance (Table 130.16.070.1d) that signs are unlit in the RF-L zone district within a Community Region.

Water Resources

The project has been designed and mitigated to reduce the potential of animal waste entering the stream that runs the length of the property. A grassy swale is shown on the site plan (Exhibit E) that is designed to intercept runoff from the development of the equestrian facility. Water from washing horses will be disposed of by the use of a septic system. Implementation of a water quality monitoring plan that will ensure the equestrian center operation will not have an effect on water quality. Baseline monitoring would occur prior to placement of horses on site. Ongoing water quality monitoring would occur for a period of four years. The applicant will report all findings to the County for review.

In order to approve the use, the approving authority must find that the use is consistent with the General Plan and would not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare nor injurious to the neighborhood. Based on the staff analysis above, comments received from public agencies and implementation of the proposed mitigation measures and conditions of approval staff believes that the project would not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare and would not be injurious to the neighborhood. After obtaining a Conditional use permit, the proposed uses would be consistent with the provisions of the RF-L zone district and would be consistent with the Community Region and the character of the surrounding area.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Staff has prepared a Mitigated Negative Declaration (Exhibit CC) to assess project-related environmental impacts. Based on the Initial Study, staff finds that the project could have a significant effect on air quality, water quality, biological resources, and cultural resources. However, the project has been modified to incorporate the mitigation measures identified in the Initial Study which will reduce the impacts to a level considered to be less than significant. Therefore, a Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared and a Notice of Determination (NOD) will be filed. A \$50.00 filing fee for the NOD is required and the NOD must be filed within five working days from the project approval.

The filing of the NOD begins the statute of limitations time period for when litigation may be filed against the County's action on the project. If the NOD is filed the statute of limitations ends 30 days from its filing. If no NOD is filed, it ends 180 days from the date of final action by the County.

In accordance with California Fish and Game Code Section 711.4, the project is subject to the correct fee after approval, but prior to the County filing the Notice of Determination on the project. This fee plus the \$50.00 filing fee, is to be submitted to Planning Services and must be made payable to El Dorado County. The payment is forwarded to the State Department of Fish and Wildlife and is used to help defray the cost of managing and protecting the State's fish and wildlife resources.

SUPPORT INFORMATION

Attachments to Staff Report:

Findings
Conditions of Approval

Exhibit A.....	Location Map
Exhibit B.....	Assessor's Parcel Map
Exhibit C.....	General Plan Map
Exhibit D.....	Zone District Map
Exhibit E.....	Site Plan; February 5, 2016
Exhibit F.....	Applicant-submitted Project Description
Exhibit G.....	Tentative Parcel Map; April 20, 2015
Exhibit H.....	Preliminary Grading Plan; January 22, 2014
Exhibit I.....	Preliminary Utility Plan; January 22, 2014
Exhibit J.....	Preliminary Wetland Exhibit; March 11, 2011
Exhibit K.....	Slope Analysis; February 28, 2011
Exhibit L.....	Existing Tree Canopy Plan; February 28, 2011
Exhibit M.....	Preliminary Tree Preservation Plan; February 28, 2011
Exhibit N.....	Monument Sign Elevation
Exhibit O.....	Store/Office/Club Elevations
Exhibit P.....	Store/Office/Club Site Plan
Exhibit Q.....	Covered Arena Elevations
Exhibit R.....	Covered Arena Floor Plan
Exhibit S.....	Typical Stall Barn Elevations
Exhibit T1-2.....	Typical Stall Barn Floor Plan
Exhibit U.....	Typical Project Colors
Exhibit V.....	Preliminary Landscape Plan
Exhibit W1-2.....	Engineers Opinion of Cost Sewer Improvements
Exhibit X1-4.....	Oak Tree Mitigation Plan (Option A)
Exhibit Y1-7.....	Photometric and Lighting Plan
Exhibit Z.....	Cultural Resource Protection Area
Exhibit AA.....	Water Quality Monitoring Plan, September 8, 2015
Exhibit BB.....	Letter of Agreement from the Green Springs Ranch Landowners Association; August 13, 2015
Exhibit CC.....	Proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration and Initial Study