

# COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

# **ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT DIVISION**

Placerville Office: 2850 Fairlane Court, Placerville, CA 95667 Phone (530) 621-5300, Fax (530) 642-1531 Fax (530) 626-7130 Lake Tahoe Office: 3368 Lake Tahoe Blvd., Suite 303, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150 Phone: (530) 573-3450, Fax (530) 542-3364

November 1, 2013

Jeff Tillman South Tahoe Refuse, dba Sierra Disposal Services 2140 Ruth Avenue South Lake Tahoe CA 95150-4534

Subject:

Sierra Disposal Service (SDS) Rate Adjustment Request

Dear Mr. Tillman,

Thank you for providing the documentation we requested. In accordance with the terms of the franchise agreement, we have reviewed the financial statements and projections for Sierra Disposal Services (SDS) and Parent company South Tahoe Refuse, the additional documentation supplied September 20, 2013, and the audited financial statements received yesterday. We have considered all of the information and present the following findings to support a recommended rate increase of 6.6%.

## **Recycling Revenue**

In accordance with your previous letter, the decrease in recycling revenue is due in part to an industry wide decline in the price paid for recycling materials. In addition, SDS stated that they experienced a decline in commercial recycling revenue due to poaching from drop boxes and the free comingled recyclables. The losses from poaching are unfortunate however, we do not believe it is appropriate to pass that loss on to the rate payer. Rather than have SDS duplicate efforts by separating the losses from commercial comingled recycle program from those from poaching, we will allow the loss in revenue. We also recommend SDS re-examine the free recycle program in light of the decreased price of recyclables, and a decline in revenues.

#### **Insurance Costs**

Health insurance costs under operating expenses account for approximately 29% of total compensation to employees in 2012 and approximately 27% of total compensation in 2013. This relationship is consistent in projections into 2015. SDS indicated in the September 20, 2013 response "(t)he savings realized from utilizing a self-funded plan make it work riding out the cost spikes in order to realize the benefit of lower overall

South Tahoe Refuse Co. dba Sierra Disposal Service Rate Adjustment Request October 30, 2013 Page 2 of 3

costs of over the long term." Therefore we do not believe it is appropriate to consider these "spiked" costs in the basis for a rate increase.

The United States Bureau of Labor Statistics (US BLS) released reports on September 11, 2013 and October 17, 2013 related to employer costs for employee compensation and employer premiums for family medical care benefits. These reports reflect industry standards of around 8.7% of total compensation for employee health care premiums. The average monthly contribution per employee for an establishment with one to 49 workers is reported as \$1,127.80. Over the last two years, the average premium paid per employee by SDS was \$1,460.71. To be more in line with industry standard, we have determined the appropriate amount to allow as basis for a rate increase is 9.7% of labor compensation under the Operating Costs.

Workers compensation insurance increased in part due to the increase in the experience mod and in part due to inflation. Increase to the experience mod is due to the loss or claims history of the company, and a factor that the company can influence directly. We do not believe it is appropriate to consider the increased workers compensation insurance expense due to the increase in experience mod as a basis for a rate increase. Currently, workers compensation insurance contribution for SDS is approximately 7% of total compensation. To be more in line with the industry standards reported by the US BLS, we have determined the appropriate amount to allow as basis for a rate increase is 2% of the labor compensation under the Operating Costs.

### **Equipment Repairs and Maintenance Expense**

There was an overall net increase of 25% in equipment repairs from 2011 to 2013. Costs are projected to remain at this higher level. Between the 2012 and 2013, years, the amount spent on maintenance and repairs totals \$168,880 which approximately equals the purchase price of the new equipment. Unless SDS can demonstrate with solid supporting information the basis for this increased cost, we are not allowing the increased total for our analysis. We are instead using the equipment maintenance costs reported for 2011.

The Depreciation Expense Report as of June 30, 2013 shows that the \$8,922 loss on equipment was from Equipment S-8, which was scrapped. Unless SDS can demonstrate with solid supporting documents efforts made to sell or salvage the vehicle and its components, the \$8,922 loss on disposal of equipment reported for equipment number S-8 is not an allowable expense for the rate analysis.

#### **Bad Debt**

2012 was the first year SDS reported bad debt. According to SDS, this is due to a change in the account system. No information was provided to support the SDS billing and collection policy for clarification of when an amount is determined to be bad debt for write off. Bad debt is not an allowable expense for the rate analysis.

South Tanoe Hetuse Co. dba Sierra Disposal Service Rate Adjustment Request October 30, 2013 Page 3 of 3

The "big picture" for SDS between 2011 and 2013 shows an overall 15% decrease in revenue and 2% increase in expenses from 2011 to 2013, with most of the increase to Operating Expenses. Considering this situation, it is difficult to support an annual 1.6% wage increase and 4.5% employer paid pension (which is slightly higher than the 3.8% industry standard). As the economy slowly recovers, we anticipate SDA will realize better fee collections and find opportunities to increase revenues. We also recommend SDS search for additional opportunities to decrease expenses.

We hope to be able to take our recommendation to the Board of Supervisors on December 10, 2013. I look forward to your response regarding the recommended 6.6% rate increase.

Thank you.

Gerri Silva, M.S., REHS, Director Community Development Agency

gersi SILON

**Environmental Management Division** 

C: Terry Trease John Tillman El Dorado County - CDA Administration & Finance Div Review of Sierra Disposal Services Financial Statements Income Statements for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30,

Income Statements for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30,	Audited 2011	% Rev	Audited 2012	% Rev	% Cha	(Unaudited)	% Rev	% Chg	From Rate Application (Unaudited) 2014	3 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg	From Rate Application w COLA 2014	4 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg	From Rate Application (Unaudited) No COLA	6.60 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg
Revenues:		181			- 1			- 1	H T			128							- nange	5
Operating Revenue CA - Sierra Disposal Service residential CA - Sierra Disposal Service commercial CA - Miscellaneous	1,257,365 624,427	62.9% 31.3% 0.0%	1,358,240 629,547	65.0% 30.1% 0.0%	8.0% 0.8%	1,357,961 613,802	65.9% 29.8% 0.0%	0.0% -2.5%	1,398,700 641,270				1,412,279 638,354				1,447,586 654,313			
Total California	1,881,792	94.2%	1,987,787	95.1%	5.6%	1,971,763	95.7%	-0.8%	2,039,970	95.9%	68,207	3.5%	2,050,633	95.9%	10,663	0.5%	2,101,899	1	2,101,89	8 #
Other Operating Revenue: Forestry, Federal and State contracts Recycling sales	109,373 6,929	5.5% 0.3%	87,540 14,893	4.2% 0.7%	-20.0% 114.9%	77,138 10,586	3.7% 0.5%	-11,9% -28.9%	77,138 10,586		:	0.0%	77,138 10,586		•	*	77,138 10,586		77,13 10,58	
Total Other Operating Revenues:	116,302	5.8%	102,433	4.9%	-11.9%	87,724	4.3%	-14.4%	87,724			0.0%	87,724	-		- 8	87,724		87,72	A ##
Total Operating Revenues	1,998,094	100.0%	2,090,220	100.0%		2,059,487	100.0%	-1.5%	2,127,694		68,207	3.3%	2,138,357		10,663	0.5%	2,189,623		2,189,62	
Operating Expenses:																				
Contract labor Depreciation and amortization	58,173	0.0% 2.9%	61,041	0.0% 2.9%	-4.9%	88,925	0.0% 4.3%	45.7%	92,396	0.0% 4.3%	3,471	3.9%	92,396	0.0% 4.3%	-	#DIV/0! 0.0%	92,396	- 0	92,39	6 #
Dump fees	464,701	23.3%	440,901	21.1%	-5.1%	446,703	21.7%	1.3%	450,768	21.2%	4,065	0.9%	450,768	21,1%	-	0.0%	450,768	0	450,76	
Franchise fees Fuel	106,302	5.3%	99,309	4.8%	-6.6%	98,196	4.8%	-1.1%	101,065	4.7%	2,869	2.9%	102,532	4.8%	1,467	1.5%	105,095	0	105,09	
Hazardous waste	128,792	6.4%	146,667 80	7.0%	13.9%	152,455	7.4%	3.9%	152,445	7.2%	(10)	0.0%	152,445	7.1%	-	0.0%	152,445	0	152,44	5 #
Insurance	171,619	8.6%	261,057	12.5%	52.1%	248,195	12.1%	-4.9%	46,893	2.2%	(201,302)	-81.1%	47,643	2.2%	750	1.6%	46,893	- 0	46,89	3 #
Labor	450,283	22.5%	467,149	22.3%	3.7%	475,817	23.1%	1.9%	483,430	22.7%	7,613	1.6%	491,165	23.0%	7.735	1.6%	483,430	0	483,43	
Miscellaneous	201	0.0%	768	0.0%	282.1%	955	0.0%	24.3%	955	0.0%	-	0.0%	995	0.0%	40	4.2%	955	0	95	
Other taxes & licenses	13,368	0.7%	13,600	0.7%	1.7%	13,442	0.7%	-1.2%	13,442	0.6%	16	0.0%	13,442	0.6%	-	0.0%	13,442	0	13,44	2 #
Payroll taxes	46,635	2.3%	39,311	1.9%	-15.7%	40,107	1.9%	2.0%	40,749	1.9%	642	1.6%	40,749	1.9%	-	0.0%	40,749	0	40,74	9 #
Pension benefits	9,814	0.5%	21,273	1.0%	116.8%	24,900	1.2%	17.0%	25,298	1.2%	398	1.6%	25,298	1.2%	-	0.0%	25,298	0	25,29	
Rent	106,941	5.4%	108,738	5.2%	1.7%	108,743	5.3%	0.0%	108,743	5.1%	-	0.0%	108,743	5.1%	-	0.0%	108,743	0	108,74	
Repairs	50,950	2.5%	91,375	4.4%	79.3%	80,294	3.9%	-12.1%	50,950	2.4%		-36.5%	50,950	2.4%	-	0.0%	50,950	0	50,95	
Supplies	39,262	2.0%	30,226	1.4%	-23.0%	38,641	1.9%	27.8%	39,240	1.8%	599	1.6%	39,848	1.9%	608	1.5%	39,240	0	39,24	
Utilities	4,751	0.2%	4,729	0.2%	-0.5%	5,363	0.3%	13.4%	5,446	0.3%	83	1.6%	5,531	0.3%_	84	1.5%	5,446	0	5,44	ō #
Total Operating Expenses:	1,651,792	82.7%	1,786,224	85.5%	8.1%	1,822,736	88.5%	2.0%	<b>0</b> 1,611,820	75.8%	(210,916)	-11.6% <b>Q</b>	1,622,505	75.9%_	10,684	0.7%	1,615,850	1	1,615,84	9 #
Administrative Expenses:									•											
Advertising		0.0%	108	0.0%	#DIV/0!	30	0.0%	-72.2%	30	0.0%		0.0%	30	0.0%	-	0.0%	30	0	30	0 #
Bad Debt	m (	0.0%	-	0.0%	#DIV/0!		0.0%	#DIV/0!		0.0%	#DIV/0!			0.0%	#DIV/0!			-	#DIV/0!	
Contract labor	37,026	1.9%	-	0.0%	-100.0%		0.0%	0		0.0%				0.0%	-			*		
Depreciation Donations	756	0.0%	-	0.0%	-100.0%	-	0.0%	0.0%	-	0.0%	-	#DIV/0!	440	0.0%	-	#DIV/0!		- ^	44	*##
Donations Dues & Subscriptions	200 144	0.0%	200 109	0.0%	-24.3%	440 110	0.0%	120.0%	440 110	0.0%	-	0.00/	440 110	0.0%	-	0.0%	440 110	0	110	-
Employee benefits	2,103	0.0%	2,262	0.0%	7.6%	1,927	0.0%	-14.8%	1,927	0.0%		0.0%	1,927	0.1%	-	0.0%	1.927	0	1.92	
Insurance	21,336	1.1%	13,319	0.6%	-37.6%	16,516	0.8%	24.0%	17,505	0.1%	989	6.0%	17,505	0.1%	11000	0.0%	17,505	0	17,50	
Miscellaneous	703	0.0%	358	0.0%	-49.1%	359	0.0%	0.3%	359	0.0%	-	0.0%	359	0.0%		0.0%	359	0	35	
Office	27,679	1.4%	25,682	1.2%	-7.2%	24,583	1.2%	-4.3%	24,927	1.2%	344	1.4%	25,183	1.2%	256	1.0%	24,927	0	24,92	
Officers' salaries	173,555	8.7%	167,881	8.0%	-3.3%	166,283	8.1%	-1.0%	166,238	7.8%	(45)	0.0%	166,238	7.8%		0.0%	166,238	0	166,23	
Other salaries	113,972	5.7%	101,612	4.9%	-10.8%	105,187	5.1%	3.5%	105,187	4.9%	- '	0.0%	105,187	4.9%	-	0.0%	105,187	0	105,18	7 #
Other taxes & licenses	82	0.0%	57	0.0%	-30.5%	209	0.0%	266.7%	209	0.0%	-	0.0%	209	0.0%	-	0.0%	209	0	209	9 #
Payroll taxes	16,601	0.8%	15,886	0.8%	-4.3%	16,330	0.8%	2.8%	16,330	0.8%		0.0%	16,330	0.8%	-	0.0%	16,330	0	16,33	
Pension benefits	7,789	0.4%	5,477	0.3%	-29.7%	6,226	0.3%	13.7%	6,226	0.3%		0.0%	6,226	0.3%			6,226	0	6,22	
Professional fees	4,051	0.2%	2,772	0.1%	-31.6%	258	0.0%	-90.7%	258	0.0%	-	0.0%	258	0.0%		0.0%	258	0	25	
Rent	14,942	0.7%	14,832	0.7%	-0.7%	14,832	0.7%	0.0%	14,832	0.7%		0.0%	14,832	0.7%		0.0%	14,832	0	14,83	
Repairs	-	0.0%	-	0.0%	#DIV/0!	160	0.0%	#DIV/0!	160	0.0%	-	0.0%	160	0.0%		0.0%	160	0	160	0 #

El Dorado County - CDA Administration & Finance Div Review of Sierra Disposal Services Financial Statements Income Statements for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30,

Review of Sierra Disposal Services Financial Statements Income Statements for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30,	Audited	%	Audited	%	% B	(Unaudited)	%	%	From Rate Application (Unaudited)	3 %	s	%	From Rate Application w COLA	4 %	s	%	From Rate Application (Unaudited)	6.60 %		%
	2011	Rev	2012	Rev	Chg	2013	Rev	Chg	2014	Rev	Change	Chg	2014	Rev	Change	Chg	No COLA	Rev	Change (	
Travel & Entertainment Utilities	85 7,417	0.0%	151 (27)	0.0% 0.0%	77.6% -100.4%	121 2,492	0.0% 0.1%	-19.9% -9329.6%	121 2,531	0.0% 0.1%		0.0% 1.6%	121 2,570	0.0%	39	0.0% 1.5%	121 2,531	0	121 2,531	#
Total Administrative Expenses:	428,441	21.4%	350,679	16.8%	-18.1%	356,063	17.3%	1.5%	0 357,390	16.8%	1,327	0.4%	357,685	16.7%_	295	0.1% 0	357,390	0	357,390	#
Total Expenses	2,080,233	104.1%	2,136,903	102.2%	2.7%	2,178,799	105.8%	2.0%	1,969,210	92.6%	(209,589)	-9.6%	1,980,190	92.6%_	10,979	0.6%	1,973,240	1	1,973,239	#
Total Operating Income (Loss)	(82,139)	-4.1%	(46,683)	-2.2%	-43.2%	(119,312)	-5.8%	155.6%	158,484	7.4%	277,796	-232.8%	158,167	7.4%	(316)	-0.2%	216,383	0	216,383	#
Other Income (Expenses) Interest income Interest expense Miscellaneous income, net	(2,079)	0.0% -0.1% 0.0%	(2,431)	0.0% -0.1% 0.0%	16.9%	(1,508)	0.0% -0.1% 0.0%	-38.0% #DIV/0!	<b>o</b> (1,494)	0.0% -0.1%		-0.9%	(852)	0.0% 0.0%	642	-43.0% <b>①</b>	(1,494)	(0)	- (1,494) -	#
Total Other Income (Expenses)	(2,079)	-0.1%	(2,431)	-0.1%	16.9%	(1,508)	-0.1%	-38.0%	(1,494)	-0.1%	14_	-0.9%	(852)	0.0%_	642	-43.0%	(1,494)	(0)	(1,494)	#
Income (Loss) Before State Income Taxes	(84,218)	-4.2%	(49,114)	-2.3%	-41.7%	(120,820)	-5.9%	146.0%	156,990	7.4%	277,810	-229.9%	157,315	7.4%	326	0.2%	214,889	0	214,889	#
Provision for State Income taxes Net Income (Loss)	(84,218)	0.0% -4.2%	(49,114)	0.0% -2.3%	-41.7%	(120,820)	0.0% -5.9%	146.0%	156,990	7.4%	277,810	-229.9%	157,315	7.4%	326	0.2%	214,889	0	214,889	#
Accumulated Deficit, Beginning of Period	(207,540)	. 8	(291,758)			(340,872)														
Accumulated Deficit, End of Period	(291,758)	- 11	(340,872)			(461,692)		1												
		Total Exp	onses OR profit calc:	Sum		2,180,307			0 1,970,704			Sum (	1,981,042			Sum 0	1,974,734			Sum
			ugh interest			1,508			1,494				1,494				1,494			
			ugh franchise fee d charitable contr			98,196 440			101,065 440				102,532 440				105,095 440			
	Total Allowed C					2,080,163			1,867,705				1,876,576				1,867,705			
		(Calcul (Per Ap		97.00% 64,335 213,658			97.00% 57,764 213,658				97.00% 58,038 216,374				97.00% 57,764 213,658					
				1,508 98,196			1,494 101,065				1,494 102,532				1,494 105,095					
	Total Additional	Expenses				99,704			102,559				104,026				106,589			
		Re	evenue Requirem	ent		2,393,525			2,183,922				2,196,976	2,196,976			2,187,952			
		S	urplus / Deficienc	у		(334,038)			(56,228)				(58,619)				1,671			

El Dorado County - CDA Administration & Finance Div Review of Sierra Disposal Services Financial Statements Income Statements for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30,

Audited 2011	% Rev	Audited 2012	% Rev	% Chg	(Unaudited) 2013	% Rev	% Chg	From Rate Application (Unaudited) 2014	3 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg	From Rate Application w COLA 2014	4 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg	_	From Rate Application (Unaudited) No COLA	6.60 % Rev	\$ Change	% Chg
	=		:																	
	-																			
	-																			