

FINDINGS

Design Review Revision DR08-0003-R/Saratoga Retail Planning Commission/December 14, 2017

1.0 CEQA FINDINGS

- 1.1 El Dorado County has considered the Mitigated Negative Declaration together with the comments received during the public review process. The proposed project, as conditioned, will not have a significant effect on the environment. The Mitigated Negative Declaration reflects the independent judgment of the County, has been completed in compliance with CEQA, and is adequate for this proposal.
- 1.2 Through feasible conditions and mitigation placed upon the project, impacts on the environment have been eliminated or substantially mitigated.
- 1.3 Public Resources Code Section 21081.6 requires the County to adopt a reporting or monitoring program for the changes to the project, which it has adopted or made a condition of approval in order to mitigate or avoid significant effects on the environment. The approved project description, conditions of approval, and mitigation measures with their corresponding permit monitoring requirements, are hereby adopted as the monitoring program for this project. The monitoring program is designed to ensure compliance during project implementation.
- 1.4 The documents and other materials, which constitute the record of proceedings upon which this decision is based, are in the custody of Planning Services at 2850 Fairlane Court, Placerville, CA, 95667.

2.0 GENERAL PLAN FINDINGS

2.1 The project is consistent with General Plan Policy 2.2.1.2.

The purpose of the Commercial land use category is to provide a full range of commercial retail, office, and service uses to serve the residents, businesses, and visitors of El Dorado County. This designation is considered appropriate within Community Regions, Rural Centers and Rural Regions.

Rationale: The project is consistent with the Commercial (C) land use designation of the subject site as defined by General Plan Policy 2.2.1.2.(Exhibit C). The project proposes two drive-thru restaurants and a commercial retail building consistent within the Commercial land use designation, which provides for a full range of commercial retail, office, and service uses to serve the residents, businesses, and visitors of El Dorado County.

2.2 The project is consistent with General Plan Policy 2.2.5.2.

All applications for discretionary projects or permits including, but not limited to, General Plan amendments, zoning boundary amendments, tentative maps for major and minor land divisions, and special use permits shall be reviewed to determine consistency with the policies of the General Plan. No approvals shall be granted unless a finding is made that the project or permit is consistent with the General Plan. In the case of General Plan amendments, such amendments can be rendered consistent with the General Plan by modifying or deleting the General Plan provisions, including both the land use map and any relevant textual policies, with which the proposed amendments would be inconsistent.

Rationale: The project has been reviewed in accordance with General Plan Policy 2.2.5.2 and has been found to be consistent with all applicable policies of the General Plan. As conditioned, the proposal is consistent with the intent of the General Plan, as determined within the General Plan Findings.

2.3 The project is consistent with General Plan Policy 2.2.5.21.

Policy 2.2.5.21 requires development projects to be located and designed in a manner that avoids incompatibility with adjoining land uses that are permitted by the policies in effect at the time the development project is proposed.

Rationale: The proposed drive-thru restaurants and commercial retail building was designed in a manner that is similar to, and consistent with, the surrounding commercial land uses. Commercial buildings located east, west, and south of the project site are either two-story or one-story professional offices or retail businesses. The property to the northwest of the site is residential, consisting of a two-story apartment building. The apartment building is surrounded on east and south by commercial property. In the vicinity of the project site there are a mix of commercial and residential uses. As such, the proposed commercial use fits well with the context of the surrounding area. The proposed design review changes would be compatible with the design of the existing buildings; there would be no conflict with this Policy.

2.4 The project is consistent with General Plan Policy 2.8.1.1.

Development shall limit excess nighttime light and glare from parking area lighting, signage, and buildings. Consideration will be given to design features, namely directional shielding for street lighting, parking lot lighting, sport field lighting, and other significant light sources, that could reduce effects from nighttime lighting. In addition, consideration will be given to the use of automatic shutoffs or motion sensors for lighting features in rural areas to further reduce excess nighttime light.

Rationale: The proposed development would include indoor lighting and outdoor lighting. These new sources of light would be visible from a distance at night. The proposed project will change the character of these parcels from vacant land that generates no light to lighted commercial parcels, which is similar to existing commercial development in the area. Future outdoor lighting for new development is required conformance to Section 130.34 of the El Dorado County Zoning Ordinance, and be fully shielded pursuant to the Illumination Engineering Society of Northern America's (IESNA) full cut-off designation. This ordinance requires that no light spills over onto adjacent properties as demonstrated by a photometric study that will be reviewed for compliance during the building permit process.

3.0 ZONING FINDINGS

3.1 The proposed use is consistent with Title 130.22.

The CC zone is intended to provide for retail sales, office, and service needs of the residents residing within the surrounding community and accommodates the commercial and service needs of visitors to the County.

Rationale: The parcel is zoned Commercial, Community (CC). The Commercial Zone matrix of allowed uses and permit requirements establishes those uses that are permitted and those that require approval by a Conditional Use Permit in the CC zone district. The matrix includes commercial uses, including Restaurants and Retail Sales.

The project has been analyzed in accordance with Zoning Ordinance Section 130.23.030 (Development Standards) for minimum lot size, dimensions, height and building setbacks. The project, as proposed, is consistent with the Zoning Ordinance because the project will comply with building setbacks and other applicable standards.

Signs:

3.2 The proposed use is consistent with Chapter 130.16, Signs.

The proposed signs for the project must comply with the Chapter 130.16 of the Zoning ordinance, Signs. The three new buildings will each have their own building attached signs. According to Table 130.16.070.1b- Community Region Area Signage Standards for Permanent On-Site Signs, both freestanding signs and building attached signs in the Community Commercial Zoning District are limited to 50 square feet of max signage area with no more than 12 feet in height for freestanding signs.

Rationale: The proposed floor area of building 2A is +/- 2,800 square feet, building 2B is +/- 3,000 square feet, and building 3 is +/- 4,658 square feet for a total of 10,458 square feet. Because all three buildings are detached from

each other, they are classified as individual establishments under the sign ordinance. The proposed individual building square footage is in accordance with table 130.16.070.1b of 50 square feet maximum sign area for attached building signs. A signage program was submitted for building 3 (Chick-fil-a) (Exhibit R). This signage package does conform to the zoning ordinance standards. The signage package was also reviewed and approved by Serrano on September 7, 2017 (Exhibit S). The remaining buildings will follow a similar signage package as Chick-fil-a.

Lighting:

3.3 The proposed use is consistent with Title 130.34.

All outdoor lighting shall be located, adequately shielded, and directed such that no direct light falls outside the property line, or into the public right-of-way.

Rationale: As the subject site is part of a larger shopping center, the lighting for the site as a whole is not proposed to change and remain consistent with Phase I. Some small-scale landscaping lighting and lighting at the exterior of the buildings would be installed. As shown in the project plans and elevations, no proposed lighting will direct light outside the property line or into the public right-of-way.

Parking:

3.4 The project is consistent with Chapter 130.35, Parking and Loading; Design Standards.

The project has been analyzed in accordance with Zoning Ordinance Section 130.35. This Chapter contains standards for off-street parking requirements for residential and non-residential uses. Additional standards for the design of the required parking for new development are found in the Design and Improvement Standards Manual (DISM) and the Community Design Standards for Parking and Loading Standards.

Rationale: Section 130.35.030 – Off-Street Parking and Loading Requirements requires restaurants with a drive-through to include one Off-Street Vehicle Parking per 300 square feet of GFA (Gross Floor Area); plus 1 RV space for every 20 parking spaces. The proposed three building include uses that involve two drive-through restaurants and a commercial retail store. Each of these uses requires 1 parking space per 300 square feet of building size. The drive-through restaurants also require one RV space for every 20 required parking space. Cumulatively, the project is required to provide 38 parking stalls and 2 RV parking spaces. The project proposes 68 parking stalls with no RV parking. The project does not include RV parking due to the shallow depth constraints of the property in providing pull thru 38x10 feet RV parking spaces. In an effort to resolve the issue, the project

applicants have indicated that the additional 30 parking stalls provided could be used for RV's/Trailers by parking over 4-5 of these parking stalls. This would give the project flexibility in its parking managements to provide both additional standard vehicle stalls and/or RV parking based on demand (Exhibit T). The applicants; therefore, have requested a waiver to the RV parking space requirement.

The Community Design Standards for Parking and Loading Standards also establishes standards for drive-through facilities for both development and design. The project was analyzed against these standards.

Rationale: Building 2A's (Habit Burger) drive-through facility is 120 feet from the nearest residential zoned lot, which exceeds the minimum 50 feet prescribed standard. The project site plan depicts the drive-through queuing spaces for Building 2A at 9 vehicles, which exceeds the Community Design Standards of four cars per drive-through window in addition to the car receiving service. Likewise, Building 3 (Chick-fil-A) exceeds the same queuing standard with 15 vehicles queuing spaces. The drive-through facilities are proposed to include physical separation from other traffic circulation with concrete curbing as required.

The project's vehicle queuing capacity was also analyzed in the Saratoga Retail Phase 2: Transportation Impact Study (Exhibit U). For instance, the Queuing Analysis section of the study indicates that Building 3 has the capacity of accommodating the maximum drive-through queue without spillback into the adjacent drive aisle and avoids impeding on-site pedestrian movement. The study was based on recently collected drive-through queuing data for three similarly sized fast food restaurants in South Placer County. Building 2A, which is closer to the main entrance of the site has the potential to impede on-site vehicle and pedestrian movement temporarily during lunch peak hours. The temporary on-site queuing associated with this drive-through facility is not anticipated to result in off-site operational or safety concerns, the project should consider adding "Keep Clear" striping along the main site access driveway to reduce the likelihood of a standing vehicle queue along this driveway during peak periods of operation.

The signage package will be provided to indicate the entrances, exit, and one-way path of drive-through lanes, similar to already submitted signage package for Building 3(Chick-fil-a).

3.5 The proposed use is consistent with Chapter 130.37, Noise Standards.

Chapter 130.37, Noise Standards, requires that noise created by new proposed non-transportation noise sources shall be mitigated so as not to exceed the noise level standards of Table 130.37.060.1 for noise-sensitive uses.

Rationale: The building of new structures is included in this proposal, so it is anticipated that there would be a short-term construction related noise impact. Long-term noise would also be created from the operation of drive-through window speaker boxes used for taking customer food orders. The Zoning Ordinance, non-transportation noise in community areas is limited to a time-average of 55 dBA and maximum of 70 dBA from 7 a.m. to 7 p.m., an average of 50 dBA and maximum of 60 dBA from 7 p.m. to 10 p.m., and an average of 45 dBA and maximum of 55 dBA from 10 p.m. to 7 a.m. These standards are lowered by 5 dBA for noise that stems from human speech. A noise study conducted by Helix Environmental Planning, Inc. (Exhibit V) measured the order boxes noise output against these standards. The study determined that the closest drive-through speaker is proposed at a location approximately 135 feet from the nearest residence. The drive-through speaker would emit noise levels of approximately 29 dBA Leq at the nearest residence west of the Habit Burger Grill, therefore, noise levels would not exceed the County's 40 dBA Leq nighttime limit for non-transportation noise sources consisting of human speech. Because the drive-through speakers at the project's Chick-fil-A restaurant are directed south towards the onramp to U.S. 50 at a greater distance from nearby Noise Sensitive Land Uses, noise levels were determined to not be significant, and specific measurements of its speakers system were not analyzed. The project is therefore consistent with the noise standards of the zoning ordinance.

Architecture and Color:

3.6 The proposed use is consistent with Title 130.52.030 and the El Dorado Design Guide.

The project has been reviewed in accordance with Section 130.52.030 of the County Zoning Ordinance, Design Review Permit. This process is applied to commercial projects with a Design Review-Community (-DC) Combining Zone. The Design Review process is limited to consideration of compliance with established standards, provided that the use proposed for the project site is an allowed use within the zone.

Rationale: As noted in Finding 3.1, the use is allowed in the CC zone. The project design, architectural treatments, and associated improvements substantially conform to the El Dorado County Design Guide and would not substantially detract from this commercial district. Design Review

DR08-0003, the original design review permit, described architectural materials for the then-proposed shopping center (Exhibit N). These included:

Phase 1: Building 1 (Walgreens)

BUILDING PORTION	STYLE/COLOR	MATERIAL
ROOF	Tierra Antigua #2311/Sandcast Blend	Redland Clay Tile/Two-piece Mission Sandcast
BUILDING WALLS	Kelly Moore 25 Blanco	Cement Plaster/Smooth Finish
CORNICE, FASCIA, & TRIMS	Kelly Moore 42 Wise Owl	Cement Plaster/Smooth Finish
STOREFRONT	Black	
FABRIC AWNING (COLOR 1)	Mustard & Black Stripes	Fabric
FABRIC AWNING (COLOR 2)	Black	Fabric
PERIMETER WALLS	Coarsed Stone/Santa Barbara	Stone Veneer/El Dorado Stone
TRELLIS	Black	Metal
WALL INSERTS	Spanish Tile	Tile

The shopping center, as currently designed, maintains many elements of these original materials. Some elements, such as the building walls, trim, and fascia have changed to different shades of the similar colors. The project applicants have obtained approval from Serrano to conduct these changes. The proposed Saratoga Retail design would mirror the design of Phase 1 (Walgreens), which include many elements of the originally approved design. Building colors would be a range of white, tan, black fixtures, and roof materials that mimic those used throughout the shopping center are proposed. The building would also include stone veneers, pedestrian-oriented awnings, and varied rooflines. The project is designed to fit into the surroundings, with design details that mirror those used throughout the shopping center. Proposed signs conform to the design of existing buildings and are in harmony with the architectural features of the building, as suggested in the building design recommendations of the Community Design Guide. The specifications for the design and colors for Phase 2 are listed below:

Phase 2: Building 2A and 2B

BUILDING PORTION	STYLE/COLOR	MATERIAL
ROOF	Junipero 9000 Series Rioja #95111 66.7% Cafe Antigua #9543 33.3%	Redland Clay Tile
BUILDING WALLS/ CORNICE/ WAINSCOT/ RAIN LEADER/ DOOR AND FRAME	Pittsburgh Paints: Enduring Ice 413-1	Cement Plaster/Smooth Finish
CEMENT PLASTER TRIM	Pittsburgh Paints: Wheat Sheaf 415-3 Pony Tail 315-4	Cement Plaster/Smooth Finish
STOREFRONT	Matt Black	
PATIO FENCE/RAIN GUTTER	Pittsburgh Paints: Matt Black	Metal
FENCE AT SITE RETAINING WALL	Pittsburgh Paints: Silver Leaf 406-4	Metal
STONE VENEER	Roughcut "Wheatfield" Grout Color to match existing site planters	El Dorado Stone
Copper Finial	Salvo Metal Works	Finial Style 308 - 56"H x 12" W (Copper)
Copper Finial	East Coast Weathervane and Cupolas	Yorkshire w/Square and Octagon Cap - 44"H x 10"W (Copper)

Phase 2: Building 3

BUILDING PORTION	STYLE/COLOR	MATERIAL
ROOF	Junipero 9000 Series: Rioja Handmade #95111	Redland Clay Tile
BUILDING WALLS	Sherwin Williams: #SW7541 "Grecian Ivory"	Cement Plaster/Smooth Finish
STONE VENEER	Roughcut "Wheatfield"	El Dorado Stone
METAL AWNING	Black	Metal