

**COUNTY OF EL DORADO PLANNING AND BUILDING
DEPARTMENT
PLANNING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**



Agenda of: July 26, 2018

Staff: Evan Mattes

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

FILE NUMBER: S17-0016/AT&T CAF 4

APPLICANT: AT&T Mobility, Epic Wireless

REQUEST: Conditional Use Permit to allow the construction and operation of seven separate wireless telecommunication facilities consisting of seven new monopine towers ranging in size from 120 to 160 feet, with individual ground equipment with fencing.

LOCATION: Seven separate locations:
Site 1 Cool (formerly Pilot Hill 2), 3100 Triple Seven Road in the Cool Area
Site 2 Newtown, 3921 Snows Road in the Newtown Area
Site 3 Pleasant Valley, Pleasant Valley Road in the Pleasant Valley Area
Site 4 Soapweed, Stope Road in the Swansboro Area
Site 5 Latrobe, Dragon Point Road in the Latrobe Area
Site 6 Zee Estates, Gate Lane in the Pilot Hill Area
Site 7 Gold Hill, Gods Way in the Lotus Area
Supervisory Districts 2, 3 and 4. (Site 1-7 Exhibit A)

APNs: 071-032-15 (Site 1 Cool), 077-091-06 (Site 2 Newtown), 078-180-38 (Site 3 Pleasant Valley), 085-010-13 (Site 4 Soapweed), 087-181-10 (Site 5 Latrobe), 104-370-24 (Site 6 Zee Estates) and 105-110-81 (Site 7 Gold Hill) (Site 1-7 Exhibit B)

ACREAGE: Various (See Table 1)

GENERAL PLAN: Various (Site 1-7: Exhibit C and Table 1)

ZONING: Various (Site 1-7: Exhibit D and Table 1)

ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT: Mitigated Negative Declaration

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends the Planning Commission take the following actions:

1. Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration based on the Initial Study prepared by staff; and
2. Approve Conditional Use Permit S17-0016 based on the Findings and subject to the Conditions of Approval as presented.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Approval of this Conditional Use Permit would allow for seven new wireless facilities to be constructed and operated located on seven individual parcels in the rural regions of El Dorado County (Sites 1-7 Exhibit A). AT&T is participating in a Federal Government funded project called Connect America Fund (CAF) – which is to provide underserved areas throughout the United States in general and throughout El Dorado County in particular with hi-speed broadband internet. The CAF project is required to provide broadband internet services capable of 10 Mbps download and 1 Mbps upload speeds. The proposed towers will range in height from 120 to 160 feet. The height of the proposed towers is needed to create direct line of site to provide broadband services in the rural areas of the County. Section 130.40.130 of the Zoning Ordinance allows Wireless facilities within the residential and rural zoning designations, subject to the approval of a Conditional Use Permit by the Planning Commission. Staff has determined that the proposed project is consistent with the El Dorado County General Plan policies and Zoning Ordinance requirement, as discussed in the Findings.

Table 1. Project Site Information				
Tower Name	APN Property Owner	Parcel Size	General Plan Land Use Designation	Zone District
Site 1 Cool	071-032-15 Kirk Brelsford	25 ac	Low Density Residential (LDR)	Residential Estate Five-Acres (RE-5)
Site 2 Newtown	077-091-06 Karen Oliver	4.9 ac	Industrial (I)	Light Industrial (IL)
Site 3 Pleasant Valley	078-180-38 Jo Anne & Vincent Glowczwskie	2 ac	Medium Density Residential (MDR)	Residential Two-Acres (R2A)
Site 4 Soapweed	085-010-13 David Ronzone	10 ac	Rural Residential	Forest Resource 40-Acres (FR-40)
Site 5 Latrobe	087-181-10 Douglas & Lianne Braun	20 ac	Rural Residential (RR)	Rural Lands Twenty-Acres (RL-20)

Tower Name	APN Property Owner	Parcel Size	General Plan Land Use Designation	Zone District
Site 6 Zee Estates	104-370-24 Richard & Ellen Wolfe	60 ac	Low Density Residential (LDR)	Limited Agriculture Ten-Acres (LA-10)
Site 7 Gold Hill	105-110-81 Anne & Roger Stroud, Kathleen O'Connor	10 ac	Rural Residential (RR)	Rural Lands Ten-Acres (RL-10)

SITE AND PROJECT DESCRIPTIONS

The proposed project was originally heard by the Planning Commission on February 8, 2018 and February 22, 2018. On the February 22, 2018 meeting the Planning Commission motioned that the project be continued off-calendar and that the project applicant would provide a more detailed alternative site analysis for each of the seven sites. Although the project is being processed under a single Conditional Use Permit number, separate applications have been submitted for each project site to allow for a site-specific evaluation of consistency with the El Dorado County General Plan, Zoning Ordinance and the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

	Site 1 Cool	Site 2 Newtown	Site 3 Pleasant Valley	Site 4 Soapweed	Site 5 Latrobe	Site 6 Zee Estates	Site 7 Gold Hill
Access	Triple Seven Road, Private Driveway	Snows Road, Private Driveway	Strauss Drive, Private Driveway	Stope Drive, Private Driveway	Dragon Point Road, Private Driveway	Gate Lane, Private Driveway	Gods Way, Private Driveway
Road Maintenance	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private
Antenna Ht	122'	122'	160'	140'	140'	160'	120'
Equipment Area	1,260 sf	1,575 sf	1,800 sf	1,800 sf	1,600 sf	1,350 sf	1,400 sf
Nearest Residence	600' NE	375' NE	220'	440'	700'	310'	470'
Oak Impacts	-	13 oak trees	-	-	-	-	-
Existing Use	SFR	SFR	SFR	Undeveloped	SFR	Undeveloped	SFR
Elevation	1,621'	2,640'	2,538'	3,150'	742'	1,560'	1,110'

SITE 1: COOL

Site Description: Site 1 Cool is located on the south side of Triple Seven Road approximately 1,200 feet south of the intersection with Highway 193 in the Cool area (Site 1 Cool Exhibit A).

The parcel (APN 071-032-15) is zoned Residential Estate Five-Acres (RE-5) (Site 1 Cool Exhibit D) with a General Plan designation of Low Density Residential (LDR) (Site 1 Cool Exhibit C). The parcel is currently developed with a single family residence. The site is approximately 870 feet south of Knickerbocker Creek and the area consists of oak trees, evergreen trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 1,621 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,296-square foot enclosed lease area (Site 1 Cool Exhibit E). A 12-foot wide driveway between the wireless communications facility lease area to Triple Seven Road would provide access.

The surrounding land uses include residential uses on all sides. The project site is located on relatively flat gently sloping land surrounded by similarly moderately sloping hills. The site is located upon undisturbed annual grassland, with similar biological communities of annual grassland and oak woodland surrounding the project.

The nearest residence to the project is site is located approximately 600 feet to the north east of the proposed cellular facility.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow the construction and operation of a 122-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,260 square foot fenced leased area (Site 1 Cool Exhibit F). There would be groupings of two six panel antennas at heights of 120 feet and 110 feet with the capability to support an additional twelve antennas. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees would be removed as part of the construction of this facility.

Access to the tower facility would be through the construction of a new driveway connecting to the existing on-site driveway located off of Triple Seven Road, a privately maintained road.

The 122-foot-tall Site 1 Cool tower is surrounded by annual grassland and individual oak trees. Clearest views of the proposed tower would be looking east from Triple Seven Road and southwest from Highway 193. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 1 Cool Exhibit G).

SITE 2: NEWTOWN

Site Description: Site 2 Newtown is located on the east side of Snows Road approximately 365 feet east of the intersection with Clouds Rest Road in the Newtown area (Site 2 Newtown Exhibit A). The parcel (APN 077-091-06) is zoned Light Industrial (IL) (Site 2 Newtown Exhibit D) with a General Plan land use designation of Industrial (I) (Site 2 Industrial Exhibit C). The project parcel is currently developed for storage for mining equipment. The lease site is approximately 1,500 feet north of South Fork Weber Creek and the area consists of evergreen trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 2,640 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,575-square foot enclosed lease area. A 12-foot wide access driveway between the wireless communications facility lease area to Snows Road provides access (Site 2 Newtown Exhibit E).

The surrounding land uses include residential uses to the east, west and north with industrial uses to the south. The project site is located on moderately sloping ground on a hill. Surrounding topography consists of similarly sloping hills. The site is located upon disturbed annual grassland, with surrounding biological communities of mixed oak-pine woodland and annual grassland.

The nearest residence to the project is site is located on the parcel approximately 375 feet to the northeast of the proposed cellular facility.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow the construction and operation of a 122-foot high monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,575 square foot fenced leased area (Site 2 Kelsey Exhibit F). There would be twelve panel antennas located at 115 feet and 110 on the tower with the capability to support an additional twelve antennas. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. The project would impact 13 oak trees subject to the Oak Resources Management Plan (ORMP).

Access to the tower facility would be through the construction of a new gravel driveway connecting to Clouds Rest Road.

The 122-foot tall Site 2 Newtown tower is surrounded by oak and pine trees. Clearest views of the proposed tower would be looking east from Snows Road and south from Thundercloud Lane. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 2 Newtown Exhibit G).

SITE 3: PLEASANT VALLEY

Site Description: Site 3 Pleasant Valley is located on the north side of Pleasant Valley Road approximately 400 feet west of the intersection with Mount Aukum Road in the Pleasant Valley Rural Center (Site 3 Pleasant Valley Exhibit A). The parcel (APN 078-180-38) is zoned Residential Two-Acres (R2A) (Site 3 Pleasant Valley Exhibit D) with a General Plan land use designation of Medium Density Residential (MDR) (Pleasant Valley Exhibit D). The project parcel is currently developed with a single family residence. The lease site is approximately 750 feet north-west of Clear Creek and the area consists of large oak trees, “evergreen” trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location’s elevation is approximately 2,538 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,800-square foot enclosed lease area. A 15-foot wide access drive between the wireless communications facility lease area to Strauss Drive and Pleasant Valley Road provides access (Site 3 Pleasant Valley Exhibit E).

Surrounding land uses consist of rural residential homes to the north, east and west and commercial uses to the south. The nearest residence is located approximately 220 feet southeast of the project site. The project site is located on a hill surrounded by biological communities of oak woodland and annual grassland.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow for the construction and operation of a new 160-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,800 square foot fenced

leased area (Site 3 Pleasant Valley Exhibit F). There would be six panel antennas located at 150 feet and another six panel antennas located at 140 feet. The tower has the capability to support twelve additional antennas at heights of 125 and 110 feet. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees will be removed as part of this project.

Access to the tower facility would be through the construction of a new gravel driveway connecting to the existing driveway.

The 160-foot tall Site 3 Pleasant Valley tower is surrounded by oak and pine trees. Clearest views of the proposed tower would be looking northeast from Pleasant Valley and Mount Aukum Roads. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 3 Pleasant Valley Exhibit G).

SITE 4: SOAPWEED

Site Description: Site 4 Soapweed is located on the north side of Stope Road approximately 1,200 feet north of the intersection with Dickinson Road in the Swansboro area (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit A). The parcel (085-010-13) is zoned Forest Resource 40-Acres (FR-40) (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit D) with a General Plan land use designation of Rural Residential (RR) (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit D). The lease site is approximately 1,360 feet west of Yankee John Creek and the area consists of evergreen trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 3,150 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,800-square foot enclosed lease area. A 15-foot wide access drive between the wireless communications facility lease area to Stope Drive provides access. The property is currently undeveloped (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit E).

Surrounding land uses consist of rural residential homes on all sides. The nearest residence is located approximately 440 feet south. The project site is located on a flat area surrounded by biological communities of oak and pine woodland.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow for the construction and operation of a new 140-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,800 square foot fenced leased area (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit F). There would be six panel antennas located at 130 feet and another six panel antennas located at 120 feet. The tower has the capability to support twelve additional antennas. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees would be removed as part of this project.

Access to the tower facility would be through a new driveway connecting to an existing driveway.

The 140-foot tall Site 4 Soapweed tower is surrounded by oak trees and pine trees. Clearest views of the proposed tower would be looking north from Awesome View. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 4 Soapweed Exhibit G)

SITE 5: LATROBE

Site Description: Site 5 Latrobe is located on the west side of Dragon Point Road approximately 0.3 miles southwest of the intersection with Latrobe Road in the Latrobe area (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit A). The parcel (087-181-10) is zoned Rural Lands 20-Acres (RL-20) (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit D) with a General Plan land use designation of Rural Residential (RR) (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit C). The lease site is approximately 0.5 miles north of the Cosumnes River, and the area consists of large evergreen trees, oak trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 742.5 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,050-square foot enclosed lease area. A 15-foot wide access drive between the wireless communications facility lease area to Dragon Point Road provides access. The property is developed with a single-family residence (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit E).

Surrounding land uses consist of rural residential uses on all sides. The nearest residences are located approximately 700 feet to the south of the project site. The project site is located on a hill surrounded by biological communities of annual grassland and oak woodland.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow for the construction and operation of a new 140-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,600 square foot fenced leased area (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit F). There would be twelve panel antennas located at 130 feet and 120 feet. The tower has the capability to support twelve additional antennas. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees would be removed as part of the construction of this facility.

Access to the tower facility would be through a new driveway connecting to the current driveway.

The 140-foot tall Site 5 Latrobe tower is surrounded by large oak trees with clearest views looking west from Falcon Haven Road. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 5 Latrobe Exhibit J).

SITE 6: ZEE ESTATES

Site Description: Site 6 Zee Estates is located on the west side of Gate Lane approximately 925 feet southeast of the intersection with Salmon Falls Road in the Pilot Hill area (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit A). The parcel (104-370-24) is zoned Limited Agriculture 10-Acres (LA-10) (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit D) with a General Plan land use designation of Low Density Residential (LDR) (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit C). The lease site is approximately 1.3 miles east of Acorn Creek, and the area consists of evergreen trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 1,560 feet. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,350-square foot enclosed lease area. A 15-foot wide access drive between the wireless communications facility lease area to Gate Lane provides access. The property is undeveloped (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit E).

Surrounding land uses consist of rural residential and agricultural uses on all sides. The nearest residences are located approximately 310 feet to the southeast of the project site. The project site is located on a hill surrounded by biological communities of oak woodland and annual grassland.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow for the construction and operation of a new 160-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,350 square foot fenced leased area (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit F) There would be twelve panel antennas located at 150 feet and 140 feet. The tower has the capability to support 12 additional antennas. The equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees would be impacted as part of this project.

Access to the tower facility would be through a new driveway connecting to the current driveway.

Aesthetics: The 160 foot tall Site 6 Greenwood tower is surrounded by oak trees with clearest views looking southeast from Safari Trail and northwest from Gate Lane. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 6 Zee Estates Exhibit J).

SITE 7: GOLD HILL

Site Description: Site 7 Gold Hill is located on the south side of Gods Way approximately 2,200 feet south of the intersection with Clark Mountain Road in the Lotus area (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit A). The parcel (APN 105-110-81) is zoned Rural Lands Ten-Acres (RL-10) (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit D) with a General Plan designation of Rural Residential (RR) (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit C). The lease site is approximately 0.5 miles south of Jacobs Creek and the area consists of evergreen trees, and rolling hills with rocky terrain. The site location's elevation is approximately 1,105 feet. Elevation in the site ranges from approximately 1,110 to 1,050 ft above sea level. All equipment is proposed to be located within a 1,400-square foot enclosed lease area. A 15-foot wide access drive between the wireless communications facility lease area to Gods Way provides access. The parcel is currently developed with a single family residence (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit E).

The surrounding land uses include rural residential uses on all sides. The project site is located on relatively flat gently sloping land surrounded by similarly moderately sloping hills. The site is located upon disturbed grassland, with similar biological communities of annual grassland and oak woodland surrounding the project.

The nearest residence to the project is site is located approximately 470 feet to the east of the proposed cellular facility.

Project Description: The conditional use permit would allow the construction and operation of a 120-foot stealth monopine tower, with one 35kw standby propane generator, one equipment shelter and one 500 gallon propane tank located upon a 1,400 square foot fenced leased area (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit F). There would be groupings of two six panel antennas at heights of 110 feet and 100 feet with the capability to support an additional twelve antennas. The

equipment shelter will house the network switching equipment. No oak trees would be removed as part of the construction of this facility.

Access to the tower facility would be through the construction of a new driveway connecting to connecting to the existing on-site driveway.

The 120-foot-tall Site 7 Gold Hill tower is surrounded by oak tree woodland. Clearest views of the proposed tower would be looking southwest from Clark Mountain Road. Photo simulations would be used during the plan check permit to ensure that the project conforms to the approved exhibits (Site 7 Gold Hill Exhibit G).

STAFF ANALYSIS

General Plan Consistency: Staff has reviewed and determined that the proposed project is consistent with the applicable policies and requirements in the El Dorado County General Plan, as discussed below in Section 2.0, General Plan Findings.

Zoning Ordinance Consistency: Staff has reviewed and determined that the proposed project is consistent with the applicable regulations and requirements in Title 130 of the El Dorado County Code, as discussed below in the Findings.

Environmental Review: Staff has prepared an Initial Study (Site 1-7 Exhibit J) and determined that there is no substantial evidence that the proposed project would have a significant effect on the environment, subject to specific mitigation measures, and a Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared. The Applicant contends that the project is exempt from environmental review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15303, which applies to “construction and location of limited numbers of new, small facilities or structures; installation of small new equipment and facilities in small structures; and the conversion of existing small structures from one use to another where only minor modifications are made in the exterior of the structure.” Although staff has elected to prepare a Mitigated Negative Declaration for the project, it acknowledges the Applicant’s contention and, as such, reserves argument as to whether the project is exempt from environmental review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15303.

SUPPORT INFORMATION

Attachments to Staff Report:

- Findings
- Conditions of Approval

- Sites 1-7, Exhibit A.....Location Map
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit B.....Assessor’s Parcel Map
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit C.....General Plan Map
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit D.....Zoning Designation Map
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit E.....Aerial Map
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit F.....Plan Set (11 pages)
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit G.....Visual Simulations
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit H.....Coverage Maps
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit I.....Radio Frequency Report
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit J.....Alternative Site Analysis
- Sites 1-7, Exhibit K.....Proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration and Initial Study